Addressing Social Determinants of Health in Maldives

Report of a national workshop
Male’, Maldives, 23-25 November 2009
Addressing Social Determinants of Health in Maldives

Report of a national workshop
Male’, Maldives, 23-25 November 2009
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive summary</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Introduction</strong></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Background</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 General objective</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Specific objectives</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Business session</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Inauguration ceremony</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Session 1: Exchange of national experiences on addressing social determinants of health</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Session 2: Overview of social determinants of health</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Session 3: Closing the gap through actions on social determinants of health</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Group work 1: Actions to address the social gaps identified in the SDH analysis for Maldives</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7 Field visit</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8 Session 4 - Group work 2</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Closing session</strong></td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Annexes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annex</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Address by His Excellency, Mr Mohamed Waheed, the Vice President of Maldives</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Address by the Minister of Health and Family, Dr Aminath Jameel</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. Address by the WHO Representative to Maldives, Dr J.M. Luna............. 28
4. Specific actions from group work 1.............................................................. 29
5. Specific actions from group work 2.............................................................. 34
6. Agenda ....................................................................................................... 37
7. List of participants....................................................................................... 38
Executive summary

The Ministry of Health & Family in collaboration with the World Health Organization organized the first national workshop on Social Determinants of Health, at Male, Maldives, between 23-25 November 2009. It was held with the overall objective of examining the role of different sectors in addressing social determinants of health in Maldives. The other objectives were: providing a platform for an exchange of experiences on reducing the health equity gap; linking salient elements of the “Colombo Call for Action” to national strategies and policies for reducing the health equity gap; and delineating required actions for the Ministry of Health & Family and other sectors to reduce health inequities.

The 38 participants included: resource persons; representatives from four countries from the Region; and local representatives from the public and private sector who deliberated upon the social determinants of health (SDH). A field visit to Hulhumale was also organized to identify the differences in infrastructure, social and living conditions between Hulhumale and the national capital Male.

Based on the group work and discussions, national actions for addressing social determinants of health in Maldives were identified as follows:

- Advocate with policy-makers for integrating health in all policies. For example, healthy environment, employment, affordable housing, waste management, safe drinking water, early childhood development, healthy diet and discouraging tobacco use;
- Advocate for policies and legislation promoting re-distribution of power, money and resources to disadvantaged groups;
- Sustain and expand public sector financing of health services in order to reduce disparities related to access to health services and enhance social protection; and to ensure affordability of emergency and routine medical referral;
Promote multisectoral alliances among public-private sectors, civil society and community groups for reducing health inequity through addressing SDH. As part of health governance, this would require the creation and facilitation of a democratic space for voicing competing views or opinions on reducing the equity gap;

Establish a sustainable institutional mechanism at Ministry of Health and Family with adequate funding and mandate to coordinate and manage intersectoral action through the “whole government approach” in order to reduce the health equity gap by addressing social determinants of health. This includes appointment of a focal point at MoHF to achieve desired outcomes;

Advocate for integrating in all national policies measures for “reducing health inequity”. This would include all priority public health conditions (tobacco control for noncommunicable diseases, climate change adaptation for communicable diseases and new threats to health etc); and

Strengthen the existing institutional infrastructure and community participation for promoting, supporting and protecting health rights of socially disadvantaged groups (women, children and the elderly).

Further, recommendations for WHO were identified as follows:

Assist to build national capacity in monitoring and evaluation of the impact of health equity on programmes and policies, e.g. privatization, private–public partnerships (PPP), healthy public policies and assessment tools among others;

Provide technical support for integrating health in all relevant policies;

Support strengthening of existing information systems to improve monitoring of health disparities for evidence-based decision making; and

Support quantitative and qualitative research in Maldives to examine social and cultural determinants that influence health outcomes.
1. Introduction

1.1 Background

During the Regional Consultation on Social Determinants of Health: Addressing Health Inequities held in Colombo in February 2009, the Minister of Health and Family, Dr Aminath Jameel announced that SDH is a new area for Maldives and she would like to hold a similar workshop at a national level in Maldives to sensitize nationals on this important issue and to improve multi-sectoral participation in addressing SDH in Maldives. Immediately after this workshop preparatory planning work for holding a national SDH meeting in Maldives started and upon request, WHO agreed to provide the financial and technical assistance for this workshop.

In was also evident at the regional consultation in Colombo that availability of data to evaluate health inequities was a common challenge in most countries. Further, unlike most other countries at this consultation, for Maldives, the lack of technical expertise in data analysis of SDH was an additional challenge. While the national workshop was in the planning stage, through WHO assistance, it was also decided to conduct the first SDH analysis in Maldives in 2009 and to present the findings at the planned national SDH workshop in Maldives.

1.2 General objective

The general objective of the workshop was to examine the role of different sectors in addressing social determinants of health in Maldives.

1.3 Specific objectives

- Exchange experiences on reducing the health equity gap through action on social determinants of health/SDH;
- Link salient elements of the “Colombo Call for Action” to national strategies and policies for reducing the health equity gap through addressing social determinants of health; and
Delineate required actions for the Ministry of Health & Family and other sectors to reduce health inequities through addressing social determinants of health.

2. Business session

2.1 Inauguration ceremony

The Minister of Health and Family, Dr Aminath Jameel, delivered the opening address. Welcoming all the participants she stated that the presence of the Vice President at the inauguration indicated the high level commitment by the government towards health of its citizen. The Minister mentioned that this workshop was extremely important as it concerns not only the health but all other sectors and all walks of society. Moreover, the Minister referred to the stewardship role of the health sector in addressing the social determinants of health.

In his address, the WHO Representative to the Maldives, Dr J.M. Luna said that the major causes of disease and premature death lie outside the domain of the health sector and that social and economic determinants are the root causes. In this context, this workshop and the first SDH analysis for Maldives was a step in the right direction. Dr Luna mentioned that this workshop was the first of its kind and that WHO was encouraged by the leadership and vision demonstrated by the government of Maldives through the Ministry of Health and Family.

In his inaugural address, the Vice president of Maldives, H.E. Dr Mohamed Waheed, mentioned that the health sector alone cannot reduce the gaps in health equity between individuals and communities, i.e. there is a need for intersectoral participation in addressing this cross-cutting SDH issue. He said that the health systems were at the stage of reform, including some possible changes with health insurance and decentralization of health services. Further, the Vice President emphasized the need to re-examine the existing health systems through the lens of societal issues including values and culture.
2.3 **Session 1: Exchange of national experiences on addressing social determinants of health**

The findings of the first SDH analysis for Maldives were presented by Dr Ravi P. Rannan Eliya. According to him, based on the national health indicators, rapid improvements were made in the overall health status and health outcomes in Maldives. However, there need to be a shift from focusing on the overall national health status to evaluating health inequities within communities and between communities and to address these issues.

Unlike in Male’, health services in the islands were pro-poor. Also, access to medicine was considered inequitable as most of the pharmacies were in the private sector. In the remote islands, there are inequities in access to health as a result of lack of a regular and affordable transport mechanism within Maldives.

The findings of the SDH analysis and recommendations for policy direction were presented in three main categories: (1) Health system inequalities, (2) Disparities in mortality and (3) Noncommunicable diseases/NCDs and NCD risk in Male’. On the latter, Dr Ravi referred to the emergence of noncommunicable diseases, concentrated in the poor, as a main challenge. This is similar to the trend seen in most developed countries. Dr Ravi mentioned that it was important to improve service provision as well as health promotion initiatives specially targeted to the most vulnerable population groups.

The discussions focused on the relatively high public health financing in Maldives and on the optimal public funding level. Dr Ravi stated that in terms of public health financing, at first glance it might be perceived that the public funding levels are very high in Maldives compared to other countries in the Region. However, he said that Maldives should be compared only with countries with a similar geography and in this sense, the public health funding for Maldives was quite similar to countries with a dispersed geography like the Pacific Islands. Given the dispersed geography of Maldives the benefits of economies of scale cannot be experienced at island level. Hence, the cost of providing health care was much higher in Maldives compared to most countries in the Region.
2.4 Session 2: Overview of social determinants of health

The first presentation was by Dr Davison Munodawafa, WHO-SEARO, who gave an overview of the recommendations of the Commission on Social Determinants of Health/CSDH: (1) improving daily living conditions, (2) tackling the inequitable distribution of power, money and resources and (3) measuring and understanding the problem and assessing the impact of action.

The Colombo Call for Action was shared with participants by Dr Palitha Abeykoon.

The common theme in the discussions which followed the presentations was the stewardship role of the Ministry of Health and Family in addressing SDH, the importance of better understanding of health inequities that exist (i.e. establishing a national surveillance system to explore health equity gaps), intersectoral role in reducing health inequities, instruments/indicators to measure SDH, importance of reviewing all national programmes/projects from a health equity lens and devising initiatives to sustain measurements to address SDH.

In the afternoon session, the focus was on sharing international experiences in addressing social determinants of health. The first presentation was on “Urbanization and Health: Bangladesh Perspective” by Mr Md. Abdul Mannan, the Joint Chief of Planning and Mr Md. Rafiqul Islam Khan, Deputy Secretary, Health Economics Unit, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Bangladesh. The main theme was that urbanization is inevitable, and that urbanization is also increasingly linked with poverty and therefore, governments need significant investments to reduce poverty and to develop an urban health strategy.

The second presentation was by Dr Dorji Wangchuk, Director-General, Department of Medical Services, Ministry of Health, Bhutan. The core values of Bhutan were clearly evident in the focus on measuring all programmes/projects first with the Gross National Happiness (GNH) index to ensure alignment of all new initiatives with the happiness objective. Several participants mentioned that the GNH index was a unique and holistic measure and the Bhutanese were using this concept effectively in their programmes and projects.
The next presentation was “Thailand – Health Equity in all Policies” by Dr Ugrid Millintangkul and Mrs Kannikar Bunteongjit, Deputy Secretary Generals, National Health Commission Office (NHCO). The link with health reform and participative health policy formulation was quite evident in this presentation. In Thailand a National Health Assembly, representing different government sectors, civil society and other agencies provides a forum for exchange of ideas and information and ensures participation of all key stakeholders in the formulation of healthy public policies. The basic principle guiding this assembly was referred to as the “triangle that moved the mountain”, i.e. triangle with its three corners; creation of relevant knowledge through research, political involvement and social movement or social learning. Further, in the discussion, participants from Thailand mentioned some critical success factors in reducing health inequity in Thailand, namely participatory decision making ultimately leading to strong commitment from all parties involved, using the concept of the “triangle that moved the mountain” and by using any open window as an opportunity to address SDH (for example, use of political changes in Thailand to push forward SDH agenda).

Prof Saroj Jayasinghe, University of Colombo, in his presentation on “Establishing National Mechanisms for Addressing SDH” highlighted several initiatives to address SDH in Sri Lanka. Prof Saroj mentioned that there was a proposal for Sri Lanka to establish a commission to deal with health inequalities using a social determinants approach. The common theme in the discussions that followed was that Sri Lanka has come a long way in bridging the health equity gap. Some factors that could have contributed to this (in addition to the health system) include political developments (in terms of voting rights), socioeconomic improvements in the country, universal access to education provided by the state ‘free’ at the point of delivery and strengthening of universal access to health care (i.e. work in the area of primary health care and maternal and child health).

Dr Eugenio Villar, Coordinator, Department of Ethics, Equity, Trade and Human Rights, WHO-HQ, in his presentation on “Synergies between Social Determinants of Health and Climate Change” said that climate change has the potential to widen inequities and therefore initiatives to address climate change must be carefully planned and viewed through an equity lens.
2.5 **Session 3: Closing the gap through actions on social determinants of health**

A presentation on “Reflections of Day 1” was made by Dr Eugenio Villar. Along with a summary of the main discussion points, Dr Villar mentioned that the commitment of the Maldivian government to address SDH was evident with both the SDH analysis and this national workshop.

The next presentation on the main challenges in Maldives in the three group work topics was presented by Mr Ubeydulla Thoufeeq, Deputy Director, Ministry of Health and Family. He highlighted the challenges in early risk identification and access to referral mechanisms in maternal health. He said that despite successes, maternal anaemia and child malnutrition persist in Maldives. He noted the social determinants that are affecting the health of mothers and children such as domestic violence and unsafe environments for children. He called for re-examining the existing public health programmes in terms of quality, cost and impact e.g. immunization and child nutrition.

With regard to tackling noncommunicable diseases, the limited delivery of health promotion including an increasingly medical service delivery model, lack of secondary prevention guidelines and inherent disease burdens like Thalassemia was noted. Consumption of tobacco and unhealthy food were identified as the main drivers for the high noncommunicable diseases burden in Maldives. Further, he mentioned that the congested living conditions (especially in the capital Male’) and lack of urban planning coupled with economic migration had contributed to ill health in Maldives.

**Common discussion areas**

- The impact of private-public partnerships (PPP) on rural communities and the need to fill the gaps in service provision to special needs groups and vulnerable groups in the population. The need to assess the impact of PPP on the health sector and cost-effectiveness measurement.
- The additional challenges posed by calls from certain sections of society to refrain from accessing family planning services.
- The importance of viewing national initiatives and policies from an equity angle.
2.6 Group work 1: Actions to address the social gaps identified in the SDH analysis for Maldives

Participants were placed in three groups each focusing on an important health issue with regard to addressing SDH as identified by the SDH analysis for Maldives. The three topics selected included: (1) health and urbanization, (2) maternal and child health and (3) noncommunicable diseases. The general objectives of group work 1 were as follows:

- To identify priority public health issues for Maldives related to the selected topic, and
- To discuss and reach consensus on actions for reducing health equity gap through addressing social determinants of health in Maldives.

Each group identified and presented four specific actions that required leadership of the Ministry of Health in closing the gap in SDH, three sustainable national actions in reducing health inequities and three barriers to effectively implement partnership to address the specific topic. Annex 4 contains the list of specific actions proposed by the groups in group work 1.

Common discussion areas

- The main common themes in all three presentations include concern over the effects of private–public partnerships (PPP) on health equity. It was quite evident in the discussions that private sector services have the potential to reduce access to care by the poor and therefore worsen inequities. Therefore, more information about experiences from other countries, technical analysis of the PPP initiatives in Maldives through equity lens and increased capacity of nationals in this area was needed at this stage. It was recommended that it is best to use non-profit PPPs in service management or services contracts and also to focus on the aspect of corporate social responsibility, especially in hospital care.
Involvement of civil society and other sectors should be balanced with the ministry’s initiatives. While some initiatives are best done by the government others might be best left to civil society or to private partners. For example, health promotion campaigns could be done by MOHF in collaboration with NGOs. However, NGOs might find it difficult to operate a health facility in a small island (due to the associated sustainability and financial issues). Participants stated that there was need to strengthen the capacity of NGOs and government should play a key role in this.

Limitations in the available data sources to evaluate equity gaps were discussed by several participants in all three presentations. Mainly, equity stratifiers were not adequately used in studies and routine data collection systems, therefore it was suggested that Maldives and even WHO-HQ to include disaggregated data with equity stratifies in designing surveys and data systems.

2.7 Field visit

The purpose of the field visit was to share the housing development plan at Hulhumale with particular focus on the planned social services as well as industrial and residential services within Hulhumale. Participants were reminded of the housing difficulties in the capital island, Male’ so that they can compare the housing plan at Hulhumale with that in Male’.

Participants first visited the Housing Development Corporation’s Exhibition Centre and were then taken for a tour of Hulhumale. According to international participants, the urban design in Hulhumale has the features of a modern urban development plan. Participants reported that in comparison with Male’, the roads in Hulhumale were clean and green, had proper parking facilities, less traffic and a lower level of pollution. There were community buildings for specific types of recreation, parks, and open places for physical and recreational activities. Adequate land was allocated for an international medical centre. Currently, there is a medium-sized hospital with some specialties. However, due to the close proximity to Male’ most residents visit the tertiary health facilities in Male’. A lot of residents in Hulhumale go to Male’ for employment. Hence, even though a lot of the social facilities are available in Hulhumale there are some service areas like employment facilities that need strengthening for complete realization of the development vision for Hulhumale. Further, it was also
evident that the Hulhumale project is still in the developmental phase and the ultimate target is to ensure that Hulhumale is self-sufficient.

Common discussion areas

- The role of the private sector was a major constituent in the Hulhumale development plan. In this plan, there were a lot of initiatives for private-for-profit organizations but not so much for private not-for-profit organizations. Participants expressed that the involvement of the not-for-profit sector was very important for improving the social services in the community.

- A lot of urban development initiatives had been undertaken by the government (in addition to Hulhumale developmental project), including Villingili urban development project, to improve the housing conditions in Male’. However, there were no studies conducted to evaluate the impact or effectiveness of these urban development initiatives. It was suggested that Hulhumale be used as a field laboratory for prospectively investigating the sociological and health implications of its urban planning development. This will enable researchers to identify ‘best-practices for urban development.

2.8 Session 4 - Group work 2

Participants were placed in three groups each focusing on different aspects of the CSDH recommendation topics. The three topics selected included: (1) tackling the inequitable distribution of power, (2) improving the living conditions and (3) measuring and understanding the problem and assessing the impact. The general objective of group work 2 was to discuss and agree on policy and strategy issues/activities including evidence gathering and dissemination required to tackle the given group work issue in Maldives.

Based on the group topic each group was given three specific tasks from the following four actions:

- Identify three specific activities that could be implemented with other partners to address the group topic;
- Propose three research topics/issues where critical evidence is needed;
Identify three sustainable national actions to measure and understand the problem with regard to SDH; and,

Propose three policy/legislative measures required to establish a mechanism to measure and understand the equity gap. Annex 5 contains the list of specific actions proposed by the groups in group work 2.

Key messages from discussants

- The importance of promoting local handicrafts in resorts and to tourists as a method to increase the income of the local communities.
- To improve participation in SDH discussions at all levels in the community (not only focusing on high level) and also to include different cadres in these discussions (not only women or minority groups).
- With the introduction of private–public partnerships (PPP) in the health sector, health finances and power will move from the public to the private sector so it is imperative to review all PPP health initiatives from an equity perspective as well as to conduct a societal discussion on the impact of PPP on health.
- As the first SDH analysis for Maldives identified stunting as an issue, this area needs to be highlighted more and further work done. Nutrition is the tip of the iceberg and its causes related to SDH include education, employment, transport etc.
- Instead of developing a new SDH council/committee to use the existing councils or committees should be used to address SDH issues in Maldives. e.g. use the National Planning Council.
- Although mortality data is coded and used to generate national statistics, coded morbidity data is not available at the national level (both from the public and private sector).
- With Maldives moving towards PPPs in health, it was important to establish a mechanism whereby relevant health statistics are reported from all health facility operators (private and public) to the concerned government authorities on a regular basis.
3. Closing session

On behalf of the drafting committee, Ms. Aishath Samiya, Deputy Director of Policy and Planning Division, Ministry of Health and Family presented the draft recommendations for Maldives to address SDH. Participants and senior policy level officers of MOHF provided comments and suggested amendments to the recommendations.

The Minister of Health and Family, Dr Aminath Jameel, stated that she was satisfied with the progress made to date on rational initiatives to address social determinants of health in Maldives. Mr Abdul Bari Abdulla, the State Minister of Health and Family also reiterated the importance of this national workshop on disseminating the results of the first Maldives SDH analysis and formulating country actions to close the gap in health equity in Maldives.

Dr Sheena Moosa, Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family, thanked the organizing team at the MOHF, WHO-SEARO and the country office, resource persons and participants representing relevant local sectors, agencies and participating countries in the Region for their support and assistance towards achieving the objectives of the workshop.

Final recommendations on addressing SDH in Maldives

Based on the deliberations during the workshop the following recommendations were made:

Government of Maldives

- Advocate with policy makers for integrating health in all policies. For example, healthy environment, employment, affordable housing, waste management, safe drinking water, early childhood development, healthy diet and discouraging tobacco use;
- Advocate for policies and legislation promoting re-distribution of power, money and resources to disadvantaged groups;
- Sustain and expand public sector financing of health services in order to reduce disparities related to access to health services and enhance social protection; and to ensure affordability of emergency and routine medical referral;
Promote multisectoral alliances among public–private sectors, civil society and community groups for reducing health inequity through addressing SDH. As part of health governance, this would require the creation and facilitation of a democratic space for voicing competing views or opinions on reducing the equity gap;

Establish a sustainable institutional mechanism at the Ministry of Health and Family with adequate funding and mandate to coordinate and manage intersectoral action through the “whole government approach” in order to reduce the health equity gap by addressing social determinants of health. This includes appointment of a focal point at MOHF to achieve desired outcomes;

Advocate for integrating in all national policies “reducing health inequity” and this would include all priority public health conditions (tobacco control for noncommunicable diseases, climate change adaptation for communicable diseases and new threats to health etc); and

Strengthen the existing institutional infrastructure and community participation for promoting, supporting and protecting health rights of socially disadvantaged groups (women, children and elderly).

World Health Organization

Assist to build national capacity in monitoring and evaluation of the impact of health equity on programmes and policies, e.g. privatization, private–public partnerships (PPP), healthy public policies and assessment tools among others;

Provide technical support for integrating health in all relevant policies;

Support to strengthen existing information systems to improve monitoring of health disparities for evidence-based decision making; and

Support quantitative and qualitative research in Maldives to examine social and cultural determinants that influence health outcomes.
Annex 1

Address by His Excellency, Mr Mohamed Waheed, Vice President of Maldives

Honourable Ministers, guests from other countries, ladies and gentlemen,

When we talk about the social determinants of health it is very difficult to separate the health of individuals, families and communities. They seem to be all related.

Individual health campaigns: Both mental and physical health – each contributing to the other. An individual lives in a family and community environment, in a society that comprises of people, organizations, institutions and the ecosystem.

Individual is in a way surrounded by the social, cultural and physical environment. I tend to think that the individual’s mental and physical make-up is an extension of the cultural and physical environment. Our thoughts are shaped by the collective thoughts within society as if the individual mind is an extension of the societal mind or minds. As a result, a large majority of the people often think alike. Societal beliefs about the causes of disease for example affect the way people treat them.

Cultural factors that affect health include the perception of disease, the causes of it and its prevention and cure. Until recently Maldivian society did not acknowledge stunting as an important health issue. Obesity was seen as a sign of good health. As a result, malnutrition was not recognized as a public health issue – similarly, prevention from disease included keeping children indoors or hiding children from evil beings and their spells.

Until today, many societies are struggling to stop harmful practices such as female circumcision. Societal beliefs about the role of women affect women’s health and development. Women are systematically deprived of life-saving care. Maternal mortality rates remain high in societies where gender inequality is high.
With advances in science, our understanding of the causes and effects of disease have changed to a great extent. Therefore, one of the most important dimensions of health systems development has become the substitution of traditional beliefs with modern ones based on proven results verified according to empirical studies.

Through public awareness programmes peoples' understanding of health has to be changed. For that to happen, the collective beliefs about health in society must also change. For example you cannot have an influential cultural institution spreading traditional messages which contradict the modern scientific findings.

Cultural intervention in health must include training of traditional leaders and spreading the new knowledge among influential institutions within society. We have been talking about what I call the societal mind and how that affects individual beliefs and values. What is equally important are the physical and institutional manifestations of those beliefs. For example, traditional healers and medicines coexist side by side with modern health systems.

Any new system requires training of its professionals and the development of new institutions to a level that will be acceptable to the beneficiaries. Health service providers at all levels need professional recognition and respectable remunerations.

In short, the new system of health care must replace the traditional system and become part and parcel of the social system.

The extent to which modern health systems reach out to the population depends on how it is organized and what underlying interests determine its social formation. Those who are following the US health care reform efforts will understand that health systems like other social systems are affected by material interests.

History has taught us that conservative political thought has always represented narrow interests, those of the wealthy. Health systems that are entirely run by private corporations tend to exclude the poor. Universal health coverage including the poor will require state intervention and social protection.
This is especially so at times of economic distress. Unemployment, reduced wages, and absence of social protection can put excessive stress on families and reduce their ability to access health services. We also know that at times of hardship women and girls tend to suffer more. Families make decisions to allocate their limited resources according to values they attribute to individual members of their family. Men and boys often get the preference.

In Maldives, an additional societal factor that affects quality of health services is population congestion in Male and depopulation in remote islands. Relatively better but stretched services in Male continue to attract more customers from other islands. Continued inflow can cause systems breakdown.

Perhaps there is no area where you see the relationship between values, societal circumstances, and health of the people than in the area of youth health and development. Youth unemployment, lack of opportunities for young people in Maldives is alienating them and causing societal distress, societal diseases such as drug addiction and mental health.

I believe we must seriously, in all sectors, begin to address this issue of youth unemployment and development.

The time has come for us to re-examine the provision of health services from a more holistic perspective taking into account social dimensions. We can no longer focus entirely on the management of existing institution. Changing hands don’t necessarily create the additional capacity required to extend services and to improve quality.

We must assess what the additional requirements for services is and plan them according to demographic changes, population migration, inflow of migrant workers, and the changing needs for health services.

It is my hope that the new Report on Social Disparities in Health in Maldives will greatly contribute to strengthening the national health system.
Annex 2

Address by the Minister of Health and Family,
Dr Aminath Jameel

Excellency Vice-President Dr Mohamed Waheed Hassan Maniku,
Excellencies, distinguished invitees and participants,

First of all let me thank His Excellency the Vice-President for gracing this inauguration. His presence clearly indicates the high level commitment by the government towards health of its citizens. Thank you sir!

This is an extremely important workshop because it concerns not only the health but all sectors and all walks of the society. However, the health sector needs to be the key player in addressing the social determinants of health.

Social determinants of health are the conditions in which people are born, grow, live, work and age. These circumstances are shaped by the distribution of money, power and resources at global, national and local levels, which are themselves influenced by policy choices. The social determinants of health are mostly responsible for health inequities - the unfair and yet those that are avoidable differences in health status seen within and between countries. These inequities arise from inequalities within and between societies and are due to social and economic conditions and their effects on people’s lives that determine their risk of illness.

Hence every aspect of government and the economy has the potential to affect health and health equity. Finance, education, housing, employment, transport, may not have the main aim of their policies on health, but they certainly have a strong bearing on health and health equity.

While policy coherence is crucial – different government departments' policies must complement rather than contradict each other in relation to health equity. For example, economic policy that actively encourages the production, trade, and consumption of foods high in fats and sugars to the
Addressing Social Determinants of Health in Maldives

detriment of fruit and vegetable production is contradictory to health policy.

Faced with the worst recession since World War II, the world economy is deeply mired in severe financial and economic crisis. Although its impacts are not uniform, no country has been immune from the current downturn. As its impact increases both in scope and depth worldwide, the crisis poses a significant threat to the world economic and social development, including to the fulfillment of MDGs.

Your Excellency, distinguished invitees and participants,

Today, in terms of per capita GDP, Maldives is one of the richest countries in South Asia. However, as we emerge from three decades of gross mismanagement of our limited financial resources and inadequate human resource development, the first democratically elected government that took office in November 2008 is faced with huge challenges with the daunting task of having to deal with huge fiscal and budgetary challenges.

However, we are optimistic.

Despite several challenges, we have already achieved five of the eight MDGs. Maldives have already achieved MDG 1, but there is growing income disparity between urban and the rural population. Poverty dynamics analysis also showed that many in the non-poor fell back into poverty and that there is rise in unemployment among youth.

Although we can achieve the MDG 2: in time in halving the proportion of people with hunger, we are faced with the challenge to promote locally grown food and change dietary habits of our people.

While we have achieved MDG 3 in achieving universal access to primary education, we are proud to note that our literacy rate of 98 is one of the highest in the world. Now it is time to focus on quality.

Goal 4 to eliminate gender disparity still needs concerted effort in Maldives. Today, more and more women are engaging themselves in decision making levels and in politics. More legislation needs to be made and enforced with regard to the rights of women and to stop abuse.
Goal 5 of reducing by two-third, in the under-five mortality rate has already been achieved in 2005. However, while reducing Maternal Mortality Rate is on track, accessibility to essential obstetric care, early detection of high risk cases in the outer islands are issues that need to be addressed urgently. We need to accept that our lifestyles are changing rapidly with development and urbanization and there are new emerging challenges to the health system. The emergence of NCDs is putting a heavy burden to the already burdened economy. In the recent years the medical model preceded the public health model in our health care system. We reiterate that PHC is the right approach to strengthen the health systems and improvement of the social determinants of health for achieving the MDGs.

We have been able to contain the low prevalence of HIV/AIDS and remained free of malaria since its eradication in 1984. Prevalence of TB is low but the few cases of MDR need greater attention.

We have maintained our stand in ensuring environmentally sustainable economic development. We realize that we are among the most vulnerable to climate change and to strengthen our convictions recently our new President of the Maldives has unveiled a plan to make our country carbon-neutral within a decade.

Today, while talking of health we cannot ignore the impacts of climate change already evident in the Maldives with a marked increase in weather conditions and coastal erosion. Over the medium-term, the main threat comes from temperature rise and acidification of the surrounding ocean. Both impacts could lead to the extinction of our prized coral reefs and the sea, the very livelihood of our economy, our two principal industries – tourism and fisheries.

Your Excellency,

Distinguished invitees and participants,

We strongly believe that the social needs of people cannot be left to the markets but we believe that the public sector alone cannot provide all the essential services to its population. As in many governments the Maldivian government is confronted by fiscal constraints that force us to carefully prioritize and restrict public expenditures.
Maldives is currently in a period of transition with respect to health care financing. The mode of financing is still fee-for-service with out-of-pocket payments. Currently the major sources of financing include the government budget; social Health Insurance, out-of-pocket expenditures; safety net programmes for senior citizens, the registered poor, the disabled and those on the pension scheme; and donors. The new government has committed to provide universal health insurance by 2010 through the Social Health Insurance and social security ensured through National Pension Scheme ratified by the Citizen’s Majlis in April 2009.

We are progressing well but we cannot be complacent and we need to learn from the experts and from the experience of others. That’s the purpose of this workshop. We need to understand that we have a heavy responsibility ahead.

In conclusion I would like to once again thank the Vice President for his presence. And also take this opportunity to express our gratitude to the international agencies in our efforts.

I wish every success to this workshop and hope that those participants from other countries will have a pleasant stay in the Maldives and take back sweet memories of this beautiful country.
Annex 3

Address by the WHO Representative to Maldives,
Dr J.M. Luna

It is acknowledged that the major causes of disease and premature death lie outside the domain of the health sector, and social and economic determinants are the root causes. In Maldives, health inequities and inequalities exist between the rich and the poor, males and females and across age groups.

Maldives participated in both Regional Conferences on Social Determinants of Health held in Colombo, Sri Lanka in 2007 and 2009. In 2009, the Honourable Minister attended together with Health Ministers from Bangladesh, Bhutan and Sri Lanka. The Colombo Call to Action (to be presented also in this workshop) was adopted by delegates and four Ministers of Health (Bangladesh, Bhutan, Maldives and Sri Lanka). Among the issues raised in the Colombo Call is the need for national strategies and plans of action, assessment of the scope and magnitude, causes and profile of health inequities, and to establish or strengthen where appropriate, intersectoral mechanisms to build and sustain actions for closing the equity gap and monitor progress.

In that context, today’s workshop is a step in the right direction for Maldives because it has conducted a health equity analysis to profile the inequities, and now we are holding a national consultative meeting to share the findings as well as chart the way forward in closing the equity gap through addressing social determinants of health. The workshop is the first of its kind among SEAR countries and WHO is encouraged by the leadership and vision demonstrated by the Government of Maldives through the Ministry of Health and Family. This national workshop is taking place at a time when WHO is calling for global leadership to address health equity across sectors. It is timely that the Ministry of Health and Family, Maldives seeks to establish intersectoral action and integrate health in all policies in order to establish mechanisms for working within and outside the health sector. The outcomes of this national workshop will definitely guide future directions in the way we address public health concerns. WHO looks forward to participating in the deliberations and also to the recommendations from this national workshop which would guide our future collaboration in this important area.
Annex 4

Specific actions from Group work 1

Specific actions requiring MoHF leadership include:

Group 1 - Health and Urbanization

- To identify the gaps of services between urban and rural areas.
- To use all sectors (including other sectors, NGOs and the private sector) to provide the services that are not provided to the community. E.g. can use transport mechanism in nearby resorts to move patients from rural islands to atoll hospitals or use the coast guard services to transport serious patients.
- To take a leadership role to coordinate and improve the linkage between health and other sectors including the transport sector to improve better access to health services.
- To take a lead role in establishing a national coordinating body focusing on minimizing SDH.
- This coordinating body can supervise if all sectors are doing enough to address SDH.
- Increase health promotion activities and awareness specially targeted to the vulnerable groups in both rural and urban locations.

Group 2 - Maternal and Child Health

- Advocacy at high level and sensitization of all stakeholders on health equity gaps in this area.
- Lobbying with the National Planning Council to ensure that public policy decisions are taken in consideration of MCH issues.
- Capacity building, for newborn care and obstetrics:
  - Including increased investments for emergency care for MCH.
- Resource mobilization for training in MCH (including the increased capacity of national training institutes).

- Facilitate private sector involvement (including investment), particularly in establishing a reliable transport service between health facilities.

- With increased private sector involvement, MOHF needs to ensure that the relevant policies, legislation and monitoring framework is in place.

- Facilitate partnerships with civil society (CSO/CBO) for MCH services.

- Ensure the relevant policies, legislation and monitoring framework/development on NGO-CBO role in MCH services are in place.

Group 3 - Noncommunicable Diseases

- Generate and analyse data to routinely evaluate gaps, define important categories (e.g. injuries) and evaluate impact of interventions like public-private partnerships.

- Community participation and capacity building of civil society to be involved in decision making and implementation.

- Institutional arrangements as well as regulations for intersectoral action (e.g. National Health Council in Sri Lanka with health ministers and other sector ministers).

- Capacity-building of MoHF and other ministries for health equity policies and actions.

**Sustainable national health actions for addressing SDH in Maldives include:**

Group 1- Health and Urbanization

- Targeting and developing provinces other than Male’ (capital island).

- Establishing a taxation mechanism in Male’ to try to earn more money/revenue which can be utilized for developing islands (i.e. alternative financing which can be allocated to the health sector, in addition to the earmarked budget from the central government).
Mechanism to create Corporate Social Responsibilities (CSR) – corporate societal responsibilities:
- E.g. Tourist resort boats to be utilized for carrying patients in case of emergency. Best to include some mandatory provisions for CSR in relevant regulations or laws.

Continuing and strengthening decentralization policies.

Strengthening the laws and regulations which will contribute to reducing the inequality gaps between rural and urban areas, e.g. decentralisation, social corporate responsibility law.

Improving the financial mechanisms including the distribution of resources in an effective and efficient manner, less services available for rural compared to urban now.

Group 2: Maternal and Child Health/MCH
- To ensure the availability, affordability and quality of nutritious food needed for MCH at all levels.
- Routine collection of data for analyzing the gaps in MCH (including health equity across segments of population).
- Public/consumer education in MCH.
- Multisectoral collaboration and commitment (ensured through the high level policy mechanism at National Planning Council).
- Education and youth involvement:
  - Adolescent and youth education.
  - Inclusion of health education including MCH in the primary and secondary/vocational training curriculum.

Group 3: Noncommunicable Diseases
- Legislation and regulation in relation to food, smoking etc.:
  - Taxing and banning of certain foods e.g. banning the import of food items with transfats in to the country.
  - Restrictions on tobacco use, e.g. Sri Lanka banned smoking.
  - Deter the advertisement of junk food and smoking.
Increased education, information and communication with regard to NCDs and improving community social participation.

Consider interventions in physical environment. E.g. in urban planning can consider areas free of vehicles, promote recreation and physical exercise facilities.

**Barriers to effective implementation of partnerships (between the public and private sectors) to reduce the SDH gap in Maldives include:**

**Group 1: Health and Urbanization**

- Geographic barrier – small communities living in different islands.

- No law to enforce social corporate responsibility in Maldives:
  - Sea planes – no law to provide provisions for special need groups like free or subsidized transportation mechanism for children with disability in the sea planes
  - Bhutan - Two seats in airplanes are reserved for patients at subsidized (lower) rates

- Lack of or insufficient grassroot awareness on reasonable expectations for health policy in urban and rural settings (considering the geographical and other challenges) in the public and private domain.
  - Previously people did not know enough about health policies to demand.
  - Current situation is reversed and people’s expectations are too high.

- Commercial viability and sustainability of each PPP initiative not assessed through equity lens.

- Resource constraint and non-availability of modern facilities in rural areas.

- It is more costly to introduce modern health facilities in rural areas compared to urban areas.

- No established system of transport between islands.
Suggestion from group was to focus on introducing green transport policies:
- motorbikes are limited in Villingili.

Group 2: Maternal and Child Health
- Information asymmetry.
- Commercial viability and sustainability of providing MCH services in dispersed populations.
- High costs associated with the absence of economies of scale.
- Adverse impact on the poor and vulnerable if private-public partnerships are introduced without assessment through equity lens.
- Limited number and capacity of civil society, including CSO/CBOs.
- Shortage of human and financial resources for improving MCH.

Group 3: Noncommunicable Diseases
- Mindset of relevant government officials, community leaders and politicians:
  - Unless equity is considered as an important factor in policy formulation or programme formulation, might not be able to reduce equity gap.
- Lack of institutional capacity to generate data on equity (MOHF, other ministries and communities).
- Lack of technical knowledge or unknown impacts of certain interventions (e.g. Private-public partnerships) on health equity.
Annex 5

Specific actions from Group work 2

Group 1: Tackling the inequitable distribution of power, money and resources

Community-based activities that could be implemented along with other partners

- Create dialogues to raise issues and ideas from all levels in the community e.g. via radio, TV channels, internet and community interest groups.
- Community-based intervention programmes through empowerment such as community-based rehabilitation (CBR)
- Introducing micro credit system within the community e.g. for fishing communities to promote and expand their business.

Research topics or issues where critical evidence is required to fully understand the opportunities/challenges

- Operational research on how to empower the people especially in atolls/ islands.
- Resource mapping and proper management by the local government.
- Household financing (earning and spending) mechanism in Male’ and in islands.

Policy and/or legislative measures

- Improve access to tertiary education for women.
- Develop policy and legislation on population and aging.
- Participation of more women in the parliament, cabinet etc (e.g. to change regulation to ensure that a minimum of 10% should be women to raise the voice of minorities in parliament, cabinet etc.).
Group 2: Measure and understand the problem and assess impact

Actions that require Ministry of Health and Family leadership

- Improve vital registration system.
- Strengthen the quality of coding.
- Link patients’ medical records to national registration database.
- Improve and standardize the morbidity statistics.
- Train and build capacity on morbidity statistics in the atolls.
- Improve survey designs.
- Better framing of questions to track inequalities and SDH e.g. vulnerability, poverty assessment, household income survey and STEPS (external) survey, demographic and health survey etc.
- Strengthening capacity of MOHF, DNP, NGOs and other relevant sectors.
- Form working group on SDH and inequities (MOHF together with Department of National Planning).
- Build capacity in both SDH analysis and policy formulation to:
  - assess and focus on priority areas (e.g. mental health).
  - ensure evidence is translated to policies.

Policy and/or legislative measures

- Policies to bring about actions on vital registration system, improving survey designs and building capacity.
- Legislation on collecting information by institutions (including the private sector and NGOs).

Group 3: Improve living conditions

Community-based activities that the Ministry of Health and Family could implement along with other partners

- Health promotion activities including nutrition, hygiene, water and sanitation (Collaboration with Ministry of Housing, Transport & Environment, Ministry of Education & NGOs).
Rainwater harvesting and testing of water quality.
Community empowerment.
Addressing vector control and waste management in collaboration with other sectors.

**Research topics or issues where critical evidence is required to fully comprehend the implementation gap**
- Social and cultural practices concerning hygiene, food consumption, accessing health services.
- Waste management assessment.
- Whether community needs are taken into consideration.
- Assessment of harvesting and usage of water.
- Assessment of pollution in Maldives and increase in respiratory disorders (Male).

**Policy and/or legislative measures**
- Formulation of Health Act to address SDH.
- Housing policy for the needy or poor.
- Subsidy for the needy and poor.
- Imposing limitations on rent.
- Legislation on increasing access to disabled persons (in building etc.).
- Legislation on controlling number of vehicle and emissions.
Annex 6

Agenda

**Session 1:** Exchange of national experiences on addressing social determinants of health

**Session 2:** Overview of social determinants of health
- Sharing experiences on addressing social determinants of health

**Session 3:** Closing the gap through actions on social determinants of health
- Group work 1: Actions to address the social gaps identified in the SDH analysis for Maldives:
  - Health and urbanization;
  - Maternal and child health;
  - Noncommunicable diseases; and,
  - Field visit.

**Session 4:** Group work 2:
- Tackling the inequitable distribution of power;
- Improving the living conditions; and,
- Measuring and understanding the problem and assessing the impact.

Final recommendations on addressing SDH in Maldives
Annex 7

List of participants

**Resource persons**

Dr Davison Munodawafa  
Regional Adviser  
Health Promotion and Education  
WHO-SEARO  

Dr Ravindra Rannan-Eliya  
Director  
Institute for Health Policy and Research Associate  
Sri Lanka  

**WHO/HQ**

Dr Eugenio Villar  
Coordinator  
Department of Ethics, Equity, Trade and Human Rights (ETH)  

**Bangladesh**

Mr Md Abdul Mannan  
Joint Chief (Planning)  
Ministry of Health & Family  
Dhaka  

Mr M. Rafiqul Islam Khan  
Deputy Secretary  
Health Economic Unit, Ministry of Health & Family  
Dhaka  

**Bhutan**

Dr Dorji Wangchuk  
Director-General  
Department of Medical Services  
Ministry of Health  
Thimphu  

**Sri Lanka**

Prof Saroj Jayasinghe  
University of Colombo  
Colombo  

Dr Palitha Abeykoon  
Retired Director  
(Health Technologies and Pharmaceuticals)  
WHO-SEARO  

**Thailand**

Dr Amphon Jindawatthana  
Secretary General  
National Health Commission  

Dr Ugird M liintangkul  
Deputy Secretary-General  
National Health Commission  

Mrs Kannikar Bunteongit  
Deputy Secretary-General  
National Health Commission’s Office  

**Maldives**

**Ministry of Health and Family**

Dr Aminath Jameel  
Minister of Health and Family  

Dr Sheena Moosa  
Permanent Secretary  

Mr Mohamed Zubair  
CEO, Indira Gandhi Memorial Hospital  

Ms Aminath Saeed  
Deputy Director-General  

Ms Aishath Samiya  
Deputy Director  

Mr Hassan Mohamed  
Deputy Director  

Mr Ubeydulla Thaufeeq  
Deputy Director
Ms Athifa Ibrahim
Assistant Director

Ms Mariyam Nazviya
Assistant Director

WHO Office
Dr. J.M. Luna
WHO Representative

Dr. Rajesh Pandav
Medical Officer (Public Health)

Ms Aminath Shenalin
TNP-Planning & Programme Management

UNICEF Office
Mr. Mansoor Ali
UNICEF Representative, Maldives

Ms Raniya Mohamed Sameer

UNDP Office
Ms Aminath Shalini
Human Rights Officer

Other sectors
Ms Fathimath Afshan Latheef
Deputy Under Secretary
President’s Office

Mr Hussan Rasheed
Deputy Director-General
Ministry of Education

Ms Aminath Nashia
Director
External Resources Management
Ministry of Finance and Treasury

Mr Ismail Ali Manik
Deputy Director
Ministry of Finance and Treasury

Ms Aminath Zoonia
Department of National Planning
Ministry of Finance and Treasury

Mr Ali Shareef
Assistant Director
Ministry of Housing, Transport and Environment

Mr Mohamed Azim
Assistant Planner
Ministry of Housing, Transport and Environment

Ms Khadheela Mohamed
Administrative Officer
Housing Development Corporation

Ms Afaaf Ibrahim Didi
Youth Health Café Coordinator
Ministry of Human Resources, Youth and Sports

Nongovernmental organizations
Dr Mausooma Kamaaluddin
Family Planning Doctor
Society of Health Education

Ms Fathimath Rasheedha
Senior Programme Coordinator
Diabetic Society of Maldives

Ms Shidhatha Shareef
Deputy Director
Care Society
The first national workshop organized by the Ministry of Health and Family, Maldives, in collaboration with the World Health Organization to examine the role of different sectors in addressing social determinants of health in Maldives was held in Male’ Maldives, from 23 to 25 November 2009. The workshop provided a platform for an exchange of experiences on reducing the health equity gap; linking salient elements of the “Colombo Call for Action” to national strategies and policies for reducing the health equity gap; and delineating necessary actions for the Ministry of Health and Family and other sectors to reduce health inequities. This meeting agreed to advocate for integrating health in all policies and legislation promoting redistribution of power, money and resources to disadvantaged groups; sustain and expand public-sector financing of health services in order to reduce disparities; and to promote multisectoral alliances among the public and private sectors, civil society and community groups. Further, participants recommended establishing a sustainable institutional mechanism at the Ministry of Health and Family with adequate funding and mandate to coordinate and manage intersectoral action to reduce the health equity gap by addressing social determinants of health. The stewardship role of the Ministry of Health and Family was also thoroughly discussed and specific actions identified.