



COMMITTEE A

COMMITTEE A

INDEXED

PROVISIONAL SUMMARY RECORD OF THE SIXTEENTH MEETING

Palais des Nations, Geneva
Wednesday, 20 May 1970, at 2.30 p.m.

CHAIRMAN: Dr M. ALDEA (Romania)

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
1. Detailed review of the operating programme (continued)	2
2. Draft fifth report of Committee A	5
3. Draft resolution on the human environment (continued)	5
4. Draft resolution on basic principles for the development of national health services	7



Note: Corrections to this provisional summary record should reach the Chief, Editorial Services, World Health Organization, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland, before 3 July 1970.

1. DETAILED REVIEW OF THE OPERATING PROGRAMME: Item 2.2.3 of the Agenda (Official Records No. 179, Official Records No. 181, Resolutions EB45.R21, EB45.R22, Official Records No. 182, Chapter II; Documents A23/A/Conf.Doc. No.23 Rev.1, A23/A/Conf.Doc. No.24, A23/A/5) (continued)

Western Pacific Region (continued)

The CHAIRMAN said that the Committee would continue its review of the Western Pacific Region (Official Records No. 179, p. 417 et seq.).

Professor YANAGISAWA (Japan) expressed appreciation of the work accomplished by the Regional Director, Dr Dy, and all the staff of the Regional Office for the Western Pacific, and supported the well-planned schedule of work for 1971. He noted that the programme of education and training was being given high priority in connexion with fellowships and hoped that the activities of the Regional Office would be as successful in the future as they had been in the past.

Dr THOR PENG THONG (Cambodia) said that his Government was very satisfied with the co-operation that existed between it and the Regional Office, especially as regards health services. He wished to express to Dr Dy his country's gratitude because he was the moving spirit behind such close co-operation.

Mr WANG (China) said that his delegation wished to associate itself with previous speakers who had congratulated Dr Dy and his staff on their achievements in the past year. He also wished to thank Dr Dy and his staff for helping his country to implement some of the projects. With the assistance of WHO, health programmes were proceeding satisfactorily and his country was grateful for the many training courses conducted by the Regional Office.

Dr CHEW (Singapore) said that his delegation wished to thank Dr Dy for assistance in solving some of the health problems of certain countries of the Western Pacific Region, and also wished to express its appreciation of the assistance given by WHO in the integrated environmental health programme and the waste disposal programme. He wished the Regional Director all success in carrying out the 1971 programme.

Dr DY, Regional Director for the Western Pacific, thanked delegates for their kind words, which he would convey to all his staff.

The CHAIRMAN, speaking on behalf of the Director-General, wished Dr Dy all success in his future work.

Inter-regional and other programme activities

The CHAIRMAN drew the Committee's attention to pages 469-493 of Official Records No. 179.

Dr WYNNE GRIFFITH (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) drew attention to page 490 of Official Records No. 179, which referred under section 22(ii) to the evaluation of methods of diagnosis and treatment of cancer. As would be seen, two centres existed, one dealing with breast cancer and the other with melanomas, and two other centres would be concerned with stomach cancer and ovarian cancer. He noted that it was the intention of the Director-General to develop those useful activities as funds became available. The United Kingdom Government wished to offer to collaborate with the Director-General in establishing a centre to deal with one particular type of cancer, namely cancer of the bladder. A group in the United Kingdom had already started to operate, on a national scale, a scheme for the evaluation of methods of treatment of that type of cancer. The group would have no difficulty in assembling data on a sufficient number of cases to allow significant results to emerge since, unfortunately, the United Kingdom had one of the highest records of mortality from cancer of the bladder. It was a disease in which British researchers had long taken a keen interest. He hoped that the Director-General would bear in mind his Government's concern with those problems.

Dr TEOUME-LESSAN (Ethiopia) referred to page 490, section 22, (a)(i), dealing with international reference centres concerned with the histopathology of tumours. He noted that a reference centre had not yet been designated for liver tumours. There was a high incidence of hepatitis, jaundice and liver tumours in Africa, and he was sure that most African delegates would agree with him and ask that a centre for such diseases should be set up.

The DEPUTY DIRECTOR-GENERAL thanked the delegates of the United Kingdom and Ethiopia and said that reference centres concerned with bladder and liver cancer would be set up as soon as resources permitted.

Assistance to research and other technical services

The CHAIRMAN drew attention to pages 475 et seq. and invited comments.

There were no comments.

Collaboration with other organizations

The CHAIRMAN drew attention to pages 492 and 493 and invited comments.

There were no comments.

The DEPUTY DIRECTOR-GENERAL said that Committee A had just concluded examination of the regular budget. The 1971 Appropriation Resolution in the second report of Committee B to Committee A (document A23/A/5) could now be completed with the figures that the Secretary would indicate. When the Committee had approved the resolution it could be incorporated in the fifth report of Committee A, which could then be passed to the General Committee later in the afternoon and to the plenary meeting on the following day. When the resolution had been adopted by the plenary meeting, Committee A could move on to item 2.3, "Consideration of the general order of magnitude of the budget for 1972". The Committee had still to examine the annex relating to those activities financed from extra-budgetary sources, and that could be done after the adoption of the Appropriation Resolution.

Dr SACKS, Secretary, drew attention to document A23/A/5, the second report of Committee B to Committee A, and pointed out that figures had been established and inserted in Parts I, III, IV, V and VI of the draft Appropriation Resolution. On the second page of the document it would be seen that a blank appeared under Part II. The following figures should be inserted in the blank space:

4.	Programme activities	\$ 60 856 277
5.	Regional offices	\$ 6 294 976
6.	Expert Committee	\$ 216 800

making a total, which already appeared at the end of Part II, of \$ 67 368 053.

The CHAIRMAN called for comments on the figures read out by the Secretary.

Dr AHMETELI (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics) said that as it had done in Committee B, his delegation would vote against the budget proposed for 1971.

The CHAIRMAN put the draft Appropriation Resolution to the vote.

Decision: The draft Appropriation Resolution in document A23/A/5, as completed, was approved by 59 votes to 5, with 2 abstentions.

The CHAIRMAN drew the Committee's attention to Annex 3, Voluntary Fund for Health Promotion, on page 512 of Official Records No. 179.

Dr LAYTON, representative of the Executive Board, said that at its forty-fifth session the Executive Board had reviewed the item, Voluntary Fund for Health Promotion, and had considered the estimated total cost of the programmes which it was planned to finance from that Fund. As would be seen from the report of the Executive Board (Official Records No. 182, page 95), the Board had adopted a resolution (EB45.R21) which noted that the programmes planned were supplementary to those included in the regular budget of the Organization. The foregoing resolution included a resolution recommended for adoption by the Twenty-third World Health Assembly. That resolution appeared on page 96 of Official Records No. 182 and page 14 of Official Records No. 181.

Professor MACÚCH (Czechoslovakia) noted the great support given by delegates to the problems of environmental health and also that such problems had been given priority by the World Health Organization.

When considering the draft resolution on human environment (A23/A/Conf.Doc. No.25) he had mentioned that his delegation would like the Director-General, in planning a long-term programme, to place greater emphasis on research on the products having a noxious effect on health, for example epidemiological and pathophysiological studies of the pollution of the atmosphere. His delegation, on studying the draft resolution on research on environmental health, wished to recall that it had emphasized the need for research on water, soil and air pollution. He was not making a formal proposal but asked that the Secretariat take note of his comments.

Professor HALTER (Belgium) suggested that Committee A urge the Director-General to give priority to research under 4.5, "Environmental Health", of the Special Account for Medical Research, until the objectives were reached.

The DEPUTY DIRECTOR-GENERAL, replying to the comments of the delegates of Czechoslovakia and Belgium, said that unfortunately in the Special Account for Medical Research there were at the present time no funds available.

The CHAIRMAN asked whether there were any comments on the resolution on the Voluntary Fund for Health Promotion recommended by the Executive Board, under its resolution EB45.R21, for adoption by the Health Assembly.

Decision: The resolution was approved.

Special Account for Servicing Costs

Dr LAYTON, representative of the Executive Board, said that the Special Account for Servicing Costs was explained in Chapter II of the Executive Board's report in Official Records No. 182, pages 96 and 97. Annex 4 to the Proposed Programme and Budget Estimates for 1971 (Official Records No. 179) contained the estimated costs of the personnel and other requirements that were planned to be financed from the funds available in the Special Account for Servicing Costs. As previously, all estimates relating to the planned use of the Special Account had been consolidated in one part of the budget document (i.e. in Annex 4 to Official Records No. 179).

Following its review of those estimates, the Board had adopted resolution EB45.R22, which appeared on page 96 of its report (Official Records No. 182) and also on page 15 of Official Records No. 181. Under that resolution the Board recommended a resolution for adoption by the World Health Assembly.

The CHAIRMAN asked for comments on the resolution recommended under resolution EB45.R22 for adoption by the Health Assembly.

Decision: The resolution was approved.

International Agency for Research on Cancer

The CHAIRMAN referred to Annex 5, International Agency for Research on Cancer, on page 570 of Official Records No. 179, and said that no decision was necessary.

Additional Projects requested by Governments and not included in the Proposed Programme and Budget Estimates

There were no comments.

2. DRAFT FIFTH REPORT OF COMMITTEE A (Document A23/A/7)

Dr CASTILLO (Venezuela), Rapporteur, read out the draft fifth report of the Committee (document A23/A/7).

Decision: The draft fifth report was adopted.

3. DRAFT RESOLUTION ON THE HUMAN ENVIRONMENT (continued)

Dr EVANG (Norway) introduced the following revised draft resolution on behalf of the countries represented on the working party set up to endeavour to reach agreement on the various amendments submitted to the original draft resolution:

The Twenty-third World Health Assembly,

Recalling the principles enunciated in the Constitution, including the definition of health;

Recalling General Assembly resolution 2581 (XXIV) which invites the specialized agencies, the International Atomic Energy Agency and the Advisory Committee on the Application of Science and Technology to Development to collaborate closely with the Secretary-General of the United Nations in the preparation for the Conference of Stockholm in 1972 and to assist, as appropriate, in the work of the Preparatory Committee;

Recalling further the responsibility of the Organization to promote, in co-operation with other specialized agencies where necessary, the improvement of the various aspects of environmental health;

Recognizing that the World Health Organization should continue its leading role in the prevention and control of environmental factors adversely affecting human health,

Recalling further Article I of the Agreement between the United Nations and the World Health Organization, which provides:

"The United Nations recognizes the World Health Organization as the specialized agency responsible for taking such action as may be appropriate under its Constitution for the accomplishment of the objectives set forth therein";

Recalling as well Article IV of the Agreement between the United Nations and the World Health Organization which provides for the full co-operation between WHO and the United Nations; and

Bearing in mind resolution WHA22.57 concerning the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment to be held in 1972,

1. EXPRESSES its growing concern that the consequences of factors in the environment are adversely affecting the conditions of human health;
2. REQUESTS the Director-General to develop and submit to the Twenty-fourth World Health Assembly a long-term programme for environmental health, including, in so far as may be found practicable, a programme for a world-wide system of surveillance and monitoring in close collaboration with national and international efforts, determination of priorities of programmes in environmental sanitation within the United Nations Second Development Decade, and also for establishing a code of environmental health, together with the financial implications to WHO of such a programme; and
3. EXPRESSES the wish that in this respect due consideration should be given to the effect of water, soil, food and air pollution, noise and other negative environmental factors on human health and to the need for the establishment of environmental health criteria, guide-lines for preventive measures, and methods of determining priorities and allocating resources based on health problems and needs in both developing and developed countries."

The working party had met on 19 May and had succeeded in reaching unanimous agreement on the text, including the selected references to previous decisions by the United Nations General Assembly and the World Health Assembly, to the agreement between the United Nations and the World Health Organization and to the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment to be held in 1972. Since the draft resolution represented a compromise between varying points of view, reached with some difficulty, he hoped that the Committee would not attempt to improve the text further.

Dr OJALA (Finland), speaking as a sponsor of the original draft resolution, fully endorsed the revised draft resolution.

Professor HALTER (Belgium), also speaking as a sponsor of the original draft resolution and as a member of the working party, said that the introduction of a number of references to the 1972 conference tended to diminish the importance of the draft resolution in the context of the concerns of the Health Assembly. He would like confirmation from the other sponsors of the revised draft resolution that those references in no way lessened the importance that the Health Assembly attached to the problem of environmental health or to the task to be undertaken by the Director-General.

Dr RACOVEANU (Romania) referred to the French text of operative paragraph 1 and said that it should be revised to conform with the English text.

The DEPUTY DIRECTOR-GENERAL suggested that the French text should be revised to read: "de voir que certains facteurs du milieu ont des conséquences défavorables ...".

Dr SENAULT (France), referring to the fourth preambular paragraph, said that although WHO obviously had a major role in the prevention and control of environmental factors affecting human health, other organizations involved might perhaps take exception to the word "directeur" in the French text. He suggested that it should be replaced by the word "primordial".

In connexion with operative paragraph 3, the phrase "other negative environmental factors on human health" in the third line seemed rather vague. He suggested that it should be reworded: "Other environmental factors harmful to ..." ("d'autres facteurs du milieu, nocifs pour la santé humaine").

Mr JOHNSON (United States of America) said that there had been considerable discussion in the working party on whether or not WHO was a leader in health matters, and it had been agreed that WHO was. He was not therefore in agreement with the delegate of France and considered that WHO's integrity and character demanded that it should have a leading role in environmental health matters.

The DEPUTY DIRECTOR-GENERAL said that, from the strictly constitutional point of view, there was no reason for concern over the term "rôle directeur", or the English version "leading role". The wording in Article 2 (a) of the Constitution was as strong as the French version, and was even stronger than in the English version of the proposed resolution: "to act as the directing and co-ordinating authority on international health work" ("agir en tant qu'autorité directrice et coordinatrice, dans le domaine de la santé, des travaux ayant un caractère international").

Dr SENAULT (France) withdrew his first amendment, in view of the Deputy Director-General's explanation, but maintained his second amendment.

Dr WYNNE GRIFFITH (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) supported the second French amendment.

Dr EVANG (Norway) accepted the second French amendment on behalf of the members of the working party.

The CHAIRMAN invited the Committee to approve the draft resolution, as amended in operative paragraph 3.

Decision: The draft resolution, as amended, was approved.

4. DRAFT RESOLUTION ON BASIC PRINCIPLES FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF NATIONAL HEALTH SERVICES
(document A23/18/Rev.1)

Dr TATOČENKO (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics) submitted the following revised draft resolution on behalf of his own delegation and those of Bulgaria, Cuba, Czechoslovakia, France, Hungary, Jamaica, Mongolia, Poland, Romania and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (document A23/18/Rev.1):

The Twenty-third World Health Assembly,

Recalling that the attainment by all peoples of the highest possible level of health is the main long-term objective of the World Health Organization as envisaged by its Constitution and that the most important condition for this is the development of efficient national health systems in all countries,

Noting the successes achieved by many countries in the development of national health systems and also the numerous problems and difficulties faced by the developing health services in various countries, as reflected in the Reports on the World Health Situation,

Emphasizing once more that the carrying-out of combined measures for the protection and constant improvement of health of the people is one of the most important tasks for the governments of all countries,

Recalling resolutions WHA20.53, WHA17.20, WHA21.49 and EB39.R35 and again expressing its conviction that the development of public health should form an integral part of overall national plans for social and economic development in each country,

Confirming the conclusions of resolution WHA20.48, arising from the organizational study of the Executive Board on co-ordination at the national level in relation to the technical co-operation field programme of the Organization; to the effect that it is the prime responsibility of governments to co-ordinate not only their own programmes but also the aid they receive from external sources,

Noting the extensive work done by WHO to study the experience gained in developing public health services under various geographical, ethnic and socio-economic conditions, as reflected in the publications commemorating the twentieth anniversary of the World Health Organization,

Considering that the optimum development of the national health services in any country requires the utilization of the essential experience in the development of health services gained in all the countries of the world and believing that study of that experience with a view to utilizing it under the specific conditions ruling in various countries is one of the main tasks of the World Health Organization;

1. BELIEVES that among the most effective principles for the establishment and development of national health systems are those which have been confirmed by experience in a number of countries and are set out below:

(1) the proclamation of the responsibility of the state and society for the protection of health of the population, to be based on putting into effect a complex of economic and social measures which directly or indirectly promote the attainment of the highest possible level of health, through the establishment of a nation-wide system of health services based on a general national plan and local planning and through the rational and efficient utilization for the needs of the health services of all forces and resources which society at the given stage of its development is able to allocate for those purposes;

(2) the administration of rational training of national health personnel at all levels as a basis for the successful functioning of any health system, and the recognition by all medical workers of their high degree of social responsibility to society;

(3) the development of health services primarily on the basis of extensive measures to develop the preventive approach both for the community and the individual which will require the integration of curative and preventive services in all medical and health establishments and services, emphasizing the protection of health of mothers and children who embody the future of every country and of the whole of mankind, and the establishment of effective control over the condition of the environment as a source of health and life to present and future generations;

(4) the provision for the whole population of the country of the highest possible level of skilled, universally available preventive and curative medical care, without financial or other impediments, by setting up an appropriate system of curative, preventive and rehabilitative services;

(5) the extensive application in every country of the results of progress in world medical research and public health practice with a view to ensuring conditions that will make it possible to obtain maximum effectiveness from all health measures taken, and

(6) the health education and participation of wide sections of the public and the whole population in the carrying-out of all public health programmes, as an expression of the responsibility of society for protecting the health of its members;

2. RECOMMENDS Member countries, having regard to their own historical, social, economic and other conditions, to take these principles into account in establishing their health services and systems.

Operative paragraphs 1(1), 1(4) and 1(6) embodies revisions of the original draft resolution to take account of suggestions by France, the United Kingdom and Jamaican delegates. His delegation approved in principle the amendments to be submitted by the delegation of Switzerland.

Dr SAUTER (Switzerland) said that his delegation, after thorough study of the draft resolution, recognized that the draft set out fully and concisely the role and responsibility devolving upon the State and society in the matter of public health. Undoubtedly, an overall concept and a highly developed organization would produce greater effectiveness in the pursuit of objectives. However, the draft failed to cover the responsibility of the individual in respect to his own health and to the public health in general. In order to fill that gap, his delegation was proposing that, in operative paragraph 1(6), the words "responsibility of society for protecting the health of its members" should be replaced by the words "personal and collective responsibility of all members of society for protecting human health".

It further proposed that the third preambular paragraph should be deleted and replaced by the following: "Emphasizing once more that one of the most important tasks for the governments of all countries is the carrying out of combined measures for the protection and constant improvement of health and for promoting as far as possible the active co-operation of the population in this field".

Dr SENAULT (France) welcomed the revised draft, which took account of most of the comments made by his delegation to the plenary meeting. One point remained. In accordance with his delegation's comments in the plenary meeting, and for the reasons stated, he suggested that in the fourth line of operative paragraph 1(1) in the French text the words: "services de santé nationaux" should be replaced by the words: "services nationaux de santé publique". The idea of a national system of health services was satisfactorily expressed in the English text.

Dr TODD (United States of America) said that he agreed with the principles embodied in the draft resolution, but thought the word "national" somewhat ambiguous. He suggested that in the title, the first, second and seventh preambular paragraphs, and in operative paragraph 1, the word "national" should be replaced by "nationwide" or "nation's", in order to give flexibility to the complex arrangements which nations might require to provide comprehensive health services.

The remainder of the draft resolution, and the Swiss amendments, were acceptable to his delegation.

Dr WYNNE GRIFFITH (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland), referring to operative paragraph 1(6), expressed doubts on the distinction between "public" and "population". He suggested that in the first line the words "of the public" should be inserted after the word "education" and the words "public and the whole" deleted.

Dr STREET (Jamaica) supported the draft resolution and the United Kingdom amendment to operative paragraph 1(6).

Dr TEOUME-LESSAN (Ethiopia) supported the Swiss amendments. Personal responsibility in health was particularly important in the developing countries, where the sole person responsible in a village, a teacher or sanitarian, set an example for hundreds or even thousands of people.

Dr TATOČENKO (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics) appealed to the United States representative not to press his amendment. The word "nationwide" seemed to him to indicate the distribution of health services. The word "national" was used throughout WHO documentation in contrast to "international" and had no connexion with the word "nationalized". If "nationwide" were substituted for "national" in the draft resolution, it would create a precedent and would entail review of a number of resolutions adopted by previous Assemblies.

Dr TODD (United States of America) said that he would not insist on his amendment, although the word "national" in his country implied the federal or highest level and its use in the present context would be disturbing to physicians.

Dr SACKS, Secretary, asked the USSR representative if he accepted the French amendment to operative paragraph 1(1).

Dr TATOCENKO (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics) said he understood that the amendment was merely a clarification of the French text. He accepted the United Kingdom amendment.

The CHAIRMAN invited the Committee to approve the draft resolution, as amended by the Swiss delegation (third preambular paragraph and operative paragraph 1(6), by the United Kingdom delegation (operative paragraph 1(6)) and by the French delegation (French text of operative paragraph 1(1)).

Decision: The draft resolution as amended was approved.

The meeting rose at 4.10 p.m.