

MULTIDRUG- RESISTANT TUBERCULOSIS (MDR-TB) INDICATORS

**A minimum set of indicators for
the programmatic management of MDR-TB in
national tuberculosis control programmes**



All rights reserved.

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization be liable for damages arising from its use.

WHO/HTM/TB/2010.11

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The following experts were involved in the discussions leading to the development of these indicators: Jaime Bayona, Agnes Gebhard, Nico Kalisvaart, Joël Keravec, Carole Mitnick, Norbert Ndjeka, Imelda Quelapio, Vija Riekstina, Sarah Royce, Patricia Shirey, Edine Tiemersma, Arnaud Trébuçq, Francis Varaine, as well as the following staff of the World Health Organization: Salem G Barghout, Amal Bassili, Léopold Blanc, Dennis Falzon, Haileyesus Getahun, Philippe Glaziou, Christian Gunneberg, Peter Metzger, Nani Nair, Wilfred Nkhoma, Pierre-Yves Norval, Fraser Wares, Matteo Zignol

MDR-TB INDICATORS

A minimum set of indicators for the programmatic management of MDR-TB in national tuberculosis control programmes

The indicators are grouped into four classes :

1. Detection
 2. Enrolment
 3. Interim results
 4. Final outcomes
-

Abbreviations:

ART :	antiretroviral therapy
DST :	drug susceptibility testing
HIV :	human immune deficiency virus
MDR/MDR-TB :	multidrug-resistant tuberculosis; resistance to at least isoniazid and rifampicin
TB :	tuberculosis
XDR/XDR-TB :	extensively drug-resistant tuberculosis; MDR with additional resistance to a fluoroquinolone and a second-line injectable (amikacin, kanamycin, or capreomycin) anti-TB medication

1. Detection

Rationale

Drug susceptibility tests (DST) for rifampicin and isoniazid are indicated in patients suspected to harbour drug-resistant TB strains. Early detection of resistance is intended to ensure an appropriate drug regimen from the start and presumably increase likelihood of success and allay amplification of resistance patterns. Limited resources usually mean that DST is reserved for patients considered at increased risk of drug resistance. Groups to be targeted for DST vary by national policy but usually include patients who have been previously treated but failed a first or a subsequent course of TB medication. Contacts of confirmed MDR-TB patients, and in some settings patients with HIV-associated TB, are also often tested. DST for fluoroquinolones and second-line injectable anti-TB medication is important in MDR case management. The four indicators for detection measure the access of TB patients to DST. The delay in testing and the frequency of MDR among individuals in different risk categories is also evaluated. The importance of these parameters for the programme manager is that they calculate how the targeting and timeliness of DST, as well as the yield of MDR cases, vary by the risk category of the patient targeted.

The period of assessment is six calendar months. This is usually counted from January to end June and July to end December. Indicators are measured three months after the end of the six-month period. All data can be extracted from the basic TB register and treatment card and the laboratory register for culture and DST.

Calculation

1) TB patients with result for isoniazid and rifampicin DST

Numerator: Number of TB cases with DST result for both isoniazid and rifampicin by each risk category in the national policy during the period of assessment.

Denominator: Number of TB cases identified in each respective risk category during the period of assessment.

2) Confirmed MDR-TB cases detected among TB patients tested for isoniazid and rifampicin DST

Numerator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases by each risk category in the national policy during the period of assessment.

Denominator: Number of TB cases in each respective risk category with DST result for both isoniazid and rifampicin during the period of assessment.

These two indicators are to be calculated for all cases tested and as many risk categories as exist in the national policy.

3) Confirmed MDR-TB cases tested for susceptibility to fluoroquinolone and second-line injectable

Numerator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases tested for susceptibility to a fluoroquinolone and a second-line injectable anti-TB medication during the period of assessment.

Denominator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases during the period of assessment.

4) Delay in diagnosis of MDR-TB

Definition: The duration in days between the date when the TB patient was identified as being in a risk category as per the national policy and the date of the DST results for isoniazid and rifampicin as recorded in the laboratory register. The first date is determined by type of risk category. It may correspond to when TB is diagnosed if universal DST is practised, or when a laboratory result indicates treatment failure or persistent sputum smear positivity during a course of TB treatment, or when HIV-associated TB is detected, or, in the case of a contact with TB, when the laboratory confirms MDR in the index case.

The calculation is done on all cases with DST results for isoniazid and rifampicin (sensitive or resistant) entered in the laboratory register during the six-month period of assessment. The indicator is expressed as the arithmetic mean number of days with the minimum and maximum ranges for all episodes included in the calculation. The number of episodes included in the calculation should be indicated.

2. Enrolment

Rationale

The programme manager is responsible to ensure that all patients in whom MDR-TB is suspected or detected are placed on appropriate treatment in the shortest time possible. Early detection of resistance is intended to ensure a correct drug regimen from the start and lower risks of further amplification of drug resistance. Four minimum indicators have been identified to assess the pattern of enrolment of TB patients on second-line drug treatment, including that among children and females. An additional stratification for HIV-positive MDR-TB patients assesses the proportion of them on antiretroviral treatment (ART). Confirmed XDR-TB patients should be put on adequate medication. A comparison of enrolled to identified MDR-TB cases gives an indication of access to care albeit that patients started on treatment may have been detected prior to the period of assessment.

This period is six calendar months, usually counted from January to end June and July to end December. Indicators are measured in the month following the end of the six-month period. All data can be extracted from the MDR-TB treatment register and the laboratory register for culture and DST.

Calculation

1) MDR-TB cases (suspected or confirmed) enrolled on MDR-TB treatment

Definition: Number of MDR-TB cases (suspected or confirmed) registered and started on a prescribed MDR-TB treatment regimen during the period of assessment.

Comparator: Number of MDR-TB cases (suspected or confirmed) eligible for second-line drugs treatment during the period of assessment.

This indicator is computed for (i) all cases, (ii) cases aged < 15 y, and (iii) females.

2) Confirmed MDR-TB cases enrolled on MDR-TB treatment regimen

Definition: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases registered and started on a prescribed MDR-TB treatment regimen during the period of assessment.

Comparator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases detected during the period of assessment.

This indicator is computed for (i) all cases, (ii) cases with HIV on ART, and (iii) cases with HIV but not known to be on ART

3) Confirmed XDR-TB cases enrolled on XDR-TB treatment regimen

Definition: Number of confirmed XDR-TB cases registered and started on a prescribed XDR-TB treatment regimen during the period of assessment.

Comparator: Number of confirmed XDR-TB cases detected during the period of assessment.

4) Delay in start of MDR-TB treatment

Definition: The duration in days between the date of MDR confirmation (DST results showing resistance to both isoniazid and rifampicin in the MDR-treatment register) and the date when the patient started a prescribed second-line drug regimen as per the MDR-treatment register.

The calculation is done on all confirmed MDR-TB cases recorded on the MDR-treatment register during the six-month period of assessment. The indicator is expressed as the arithmetic mean number of days with the minimum and maximum ranges for all episodes included in the calculation. If treatment was started before the confirmatory DST was reported then the delay is marked as zero days. The number of episodes included in the calculation should be indicated.

3. Interim results

Rationale

Treatment for MDR-TB typically takes two years or more. The programme manager often needs an indication of how patients are faring well before final outcomes can be assessed, typically two to three years after the start of enrolment. This is particularly important when a drug-resistant TB treatment programme starts. Assessing culture conversion (for confirmed pulmonary cases) and death by six months is widely used as a proxy of final outcomes. Information on defaulting by 6 months is helpful. It is also useful to know how many patients started on second-line drugs for MDR turned out not to be MDR. And likewise for XDR. This evaluates the effectiveness of the treatment algorithm in reserving treatment for patients who really need it and avoiding a potentially toxic regimen in patients who do not.

The period of assessment is three calendar months (quarter), usually counted from January to end March, April to end June, July to end September and October to end December. All patients registered and starting treatment during the period of assessment are included in the calculation. Indicators are measured nine months after the end of the quarter of assessment. This gives sufficient time for culture results at month 6 to be issued and retrieved. All data can be extracted from the MDR-TB treatment register.

Calculation

1) MDR-TB cases on MDR-TB treatment regimen with negative culture by six months

Numerator: Number of confirmed pulmonary MDR-TB cases registered and started on a prescribed MDR-TB treatment with negative results for culture during month 6 of their treatment.

Denominator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases registered and started on treatment for MDR-TB during the period of assessment.

2) MDR-TB cases on MDR-TB treatment regimen who died by six months

Numerator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases registered and started on a prescribed MDR-TB treatment who died of any cause by the end of month 6 of their treatment.

Denominator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases registered and started on treatment for MDR-TB during the period of assessment.

3) MDR-TB cases on MDR-TB treatment regimen who defaulted by six months

Numerator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases registered and started on a prescribed MDR-TB treatment who defaulted by the end of month 6 of their treatment

Denominator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases registered and started on treatment for MDR-TB during the period of assessment

The first indicator would only apply to pulmonary cases. To simplify, the denominator for all indicators is all cases started on treatment. The three indicators should include XDR-TB cases started on prescribed treatment with second-line drugs.

4) Patients on MDR-TB treatment regimen found not to have MDR

Definition: Number of patients started on a prescribed MDR-TB treatment regimen during the period of assessment and later found not to be MDR.

5) Patients on XDR-TB treatment regimen found not to have XDR

Definition: Number of patients started on a prescribed XDR-TB treatment regimen during the period of assessment and later found not to be XDR.

4. Final outcomes

Rationale

For the manager, the final outcome is the most important direct measurement of the effectiveness of the MDR-TB control programme in terms of patient care. All confirmed MDR-TB patients entered on the treatment register should be assigned one of six mutually exclusive outcomes at the end of their therapy. The outcome categories are aligned to the ones in use for treatment of drug-susceptible TB, and the definitions are the same with the exception of cured and failed (WHO/HTM/TB/2008.402). Cases who are not evaluated due to transfer, treatment still not completed at the time of final assessment or missing information are grouped together. All patients should be assigned the first outcome they experience for the treatment being evaluated. Success (cure and completion) and death should be measured separately for HIV-positive individuals in high prevalence situations.

The period of assessment is 12 calendar months, usually counted from January to end December, and referred to as an annual cohort. All patients starting treatment during this period are included in the calculation. Indicators are measured 24 months after the end of the year of assessment. This gives sufficient time for most patients to complete their treatment and for the final culture results to be issued and retrieved. All data can be extracted from the MDR-TB treatment register.

Calculation

MDR-TB cases on MDR-TB treatment regimen **with an outcome** :

1 - cured

2 - completed

3 - died

4 - failed

5 - defaulted

6 - MDR-TB cases on MDR-TB treatment regimen with **no outcome assigned** (transferred, still on treatment or unknown).

Numerator: In the above, the numerator is the number of confirmed MDR-TB cases registered for MDR-TB treatment during the period of assessment with an outcome as noted from 1 - 6.

Denominator: Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases registered for treatment and starting a prescribed MDR-TB treatment regimen during the period of assessment.

Programmes having the capacity to differentiate XDR-TB from other MDR-TB cases and in which >5% of MDR-TB cases have XDR should report outcomes for non-XDR MDR-TB and XDR-TB cases separately. MDR-TB patients found to have XDR anytime in the course of their MDR treatment would be taken out of the non-XDR MDR-TB cohort and put in the XDR cohort.

The outcome "cured" is restricted to pulmonary cases only. The first three indicators (cured, completed, and died) should be computed separately for cases with positive HIV status in countries where HIV prevalence is $\geq 1\%$ in pregnant women or $\geq 5\%$ in TB patients (WHO/HTM/TB/2007.379). When these indicators are used at sub-national level, stratification by HIV-status may also be warranted depending on the local HIV epidemiology and the magnitude of HIV-associated TB in the particular setting.

Variables for reporting

The following tables are intended for illustrative purposes only and countries may wish to adapt the format of their reporting templates as is necessary for their specific programmes.

1. Detection

Six-month period of assessment:

Risk category (list as many as exist)	Number of TB cases			
	Total	With results for isoniazid & rifampicin	Resistant to both isoniazid & rifampicin (MDR)	With MDR and tested for a fluoroquinolone & a 2 nd line injectable
Risk category 1 (specify)				
Risk category 2 (specify) ...				
Total				

Number of MDR-TB cases with information on interval	Interval between MDR suspicion and DST results (in days)		
	Mean	Minimum	Maximum

2. Enrolment

Six-month period of assessment:

TB patient type	Identified during assessment period	Enrolled on M(X)DR-TB treatment during period of assessment
All patients eligible for treatment*		
< 15 y		
Female		
Confirmed MDR		
Confirmed MDR, HIV+ on ART		
Confirmed MDR, HIV+ not on ART		
Confirmed XDR		

Number of MDR-TB cases with information on interval	Interval between DST results and start of treatment (in days)		
	Mean	Minimum	Maximum

* suspected or confirmed MDR

3. Interim results

Three-month period of assessment:

--

Number of confirmed MDR-TB cases started on MDR-TB treatment	Culture negative at six months		Died by six months		Defaulted by six months	
	N	%	N	%	N	%

Number of patients started on MDR-TB treatment found not to have MDR	
Number of patients started on XDR-TB treatment found not to have XDR	

4. Final outcomes

Twelve-month period of assessment:

--

TB patient type	Number of cases started on treatment	Cured		Completed		Died		Failed		Defaulted		No outcome assigned	
		N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
All confirmed MDR-TB cases													
All confirmed XDR-TB cases *													
MDR-TB HIV+ *													

* see note in text above for the conditions under which these separate strata are indicated