Economically sustainable alternatives to tobacco growing (in relation to Articles 17 and 18 of the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control)

Progress report of the working group

1. At its third session (Durban, South Africa, 17–22 November 2008), the Conference of the Parties decided\(^1\) to establish a working group on economically sustainable alternatives to tobacco growing in relation to Articles 17 and 18 of the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control. The working group would replace the study group that had earlier been established by the Conference of the Parties in a decision\(^2\) taken at its first session (Geneva, Switzerland, 6–17 February 2006), and which had continued to work following a decision\(^3\) taken by the Conference of the Parties at its second session (Bangkok, Thailand, 30 June – 6 July 2007).

2. The working group established in decision FCTC/COP3(16) was requested to present a progress report to the Conference of the Parties at its fourth session, which would include, if possible, a first set of policy options and recommendations. Consistent with this request, a draft progress report was made available to Parties for their comments in May 2010. On the basis of comments received, the Key Facilitators of the working group amended the report. The present report, which includes an outline of proposed policy options and recommendations at Annex, is the result of that process and the work described below. As well as describing the progress made to date, the report outlines proposals for future work and contains the recommendations of the working group to the Conference of the Parties.

3. The following Parties are currently members of the working group as Key Facilitators: Brazil, Greece, India, Mexico and Turkey. The following Parties are Partners of the working group: Bangladesh, China, Djibouti, the European Union, Georgia, Ghana, the Islamic Republic of Iran, Mali,

---

\(^1\) See decision FCTC/COP3(16).
\(^2\) See decision FCTC/COP1(17).
\(^3\) See decision FCTC/COP2(13).
the Philippines, the Lao People’s Democratic Republic, the Syrian Arab Republic, Thailand, the United Republic of Tanzania, and Zambia.

4. The first meeting of the working group was held in New Delhi, India, 16–18 September 2009. The meeting was attended by Key Facilitators and Partners of the working group. The participants also included invited experts, representatives of nongovernmental organizations accredited as observers to the Conference of the Parties, and representatives of WHO’s Tobacco Free Initiative. The Convention Secretariat facilitated the meeting.

5. At this first meeting, the working group discussed the broad principles that would need to be considered in elaborating policy options and recommendations. It requested the Key Facilitators to draft a set of policy options and recommendations on the basis of these principles. It was also agreed that the Key Facilitators could seek further advice from other Partners of the working group when necessary.

6. Following the meeting, the Key Facilitators accordingly drafted a document containing policy options and recommendations and made it available to the members of the working group. This draft formed the basis for further discussions within the working group.

7. At the first meeting, the working group also requested the Convention Secretariat to establish contact with agencies that have relevant expertise.

8. Following the meeting, the Convention Secretariat made contact with a number of agencies with such expertise, including the International Labour Organization (ILO), the United Nations Food and Agricultural Organization (FAO), the International Development Research Centre (IDRC), the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), and the World Bank. Where appropriate, the Secretariat invited them to the second meeting of the working group.

9. The second meeting of the working group was held in Accra, Ghana, 21–23 April 2010. The meeting was attended by Key Facilitators and Partners. Participants also included invited experts, as well as representatives of nongovernmental organizations accredited as observers to the Conference of the Parties, of WHO’s Tobacco Free Initiative and of the ILO. The Convention Secretariat facilitated the meeting. The group discussed the draft outline presented by the Key Facilitators and the tasks to be undertaken before the fourth session of the Conference of the Parties, and began to draft a progress report to be submitted to the Conference of the Parties at that session.

10. The group reached consensus on the structure of the draft policy options and recommendations and on the following sections: purpose, scope and applicability; guiding principles; and international cooperation. There was also broad agreement on the structure of the introductory section (see the draft at Annex for details).

11. Progress has been made in each of the areas covered by paragraph (1) of decision FCTC/COP3(16), as described below.

   • Subparagraph (1)(a) on a standardized methodological framework. A methodological framework has been proposed and is currently being tested in one country (a member of the working group). The proposed method requires standardization through its application in other countries.
Subparagraph (1)(b) on standardized terminology, instruments and variables. A list of terms is being developed and will be finalized and defined as the policy options and recommendations are elaborated.

Subparagraph (1)(c) on promoting studies on the effects of tobacco growing. Studies on the effects of tobacco growing are currently being carried out in several countries that are members of the working group.

Subparagraph (1)(d) on promoting exchanges of information and experiences between countries. The working group continues to provide a platform for exchange of information and experience between Parties.

Subparagraph (1)(e) on assessing existing sources of information covering the status of tobacco growing, employment and the role of the tobacco industry. Members of the working group have begun working individually to assess existing sources of information, including research, experience, best practices and regulations. Their assessments and results will in the future be discussed by the working group.

Subparagraph (1)(f) on promoting synergies and cooperation with relevant intergovernmental and nongovernmental organizations. Parties have exchanged information on successful efforts undertaken so far to develop effective cooperation between ministries and other stakeholders at country level. Efforts have also been made to define more precisely the areas that would require cooperation with intergovernmental organizations. Further work is needed on mechanisms for promoting synergies with intergovernmental and nongovernmental organizations.

Subparagraph (1)(g) on elaboration of policy options and recommendations. Significant progress has been made in the elaboration of policy options and recommendations as described in paragraph 10.

12. It was also agreed that the Key Facilitators would update the draft policy options and recommendations on the basis of the discussions that took place at the second meeting.

13. The working group agreed to request the Conference of the Parties for an extension of its mandate. An extension would enable the working group to:

- continue to conduct comparative research on a standardized methodological framework that could be used to assess economically sustainable alternative livelihoods;
- complete the tasks outlined in decision FCTC/COP3(16) that established the working group;
- strengthen engagement with intergovernmental organizations that have specific expertise in economically sustainable alternative livelihoods and food security, such as FAO, and continue to engage with nongovernmental organizations that have specific expertise in economically sustainable alternative livelihoods;
- continue to exchange information on policy experiences and lessons learnt in the promotion of economically sustainable alternatives to tobacco growing.
14. The working group therefore recommends to the Conference of the Parties that:

- the mandate of the working group be extended and that it should present a final set of draft policy options and recommendations to the Conference of the Parties for consideration at its fifth session;

- membership of the working group be reviewed to provide an opportunity for Parties to join or leave the group as Partners and Key Facilitators.

15. The working group also seeks clarification from the Conference of the Parties on whether individual sellers (as referred to in Article 17) should be included in the scope of the working group. The group recommends that a discussion be held on the inclusion of individual sellers as referred to in Article 17, especially given that some Parties do not grow tobacco but allow the sale of tobacco products.

**ACTION BY THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES**

16. The Conference of the Parties is invited to note this report and consider the outline of proposed policy options and recommendations attached at Annex.
ANNEX

OUTLINE OF PROPOSED POLICY OPTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ON ECONOMICALLY SUSTAINABLE ALTERNATIVES TO TOBACCO GROWING (IN RELATION TO ARTICLES 17 AND 18)

1. INTRODUCTION
   1.1 Occupational risk for tobacco workers and growers
   1.2 Impact on employment and social disruption
   1.3 Ecological impact
   1.4 Corporate practices undermining the implementation of sustainable alternatives to tobacco growing

2. PURPOSE, SCOPE AND APPLICABILITY
   2.1 The purpose of these recommendations is to provide Parties with a general working framework within which Parties may adopt the comprehensive policies and effective measures required to fulfil their obligations under Articles 17 and 18 of the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control.
   2.2 The recommendations aim to guide Parties in implementing policies that promote the establishment of innovative mechanisms for the development of economically viable alternative livelihoods for tobacco growers.
   2.3 Parties are recommended to build up rural development programmes that cover all aspects of alternatives to tobacco growing, including economic viability and environmental protection. Government agencies, particularly those with strong influence in rural areas, have an important role to play in supporting the diversification of livelihoods in tobacco growing regions, through an array of policies and measures, including the provision of training for tobacco workers, growers, their families and children. International institutions and farmer organizations should also play a fundamental role in the decision-making and implementation process.
   2.4 While the measures recommended here should be applied by Parties as broadly as necessary, Parties are strongly encouraged to implement measures beyond those recommended when adapting them to their specific circumstances, in order to achieve the objectives of Articles 17 and 18.

3. GUIDING PRINCIPLES
   Principle 1. – Livelihood diversification (further discussion needed)
Principle 2. Tobacco growers and workers should be involved at every stage of policy development and implementation.

Principle 3. Policy to promote economically sustainable alternative livelihoods should be based on best practices.

Principle 4. The promotion of economically sustainable alternative livelihoods should be carried out within a holistic framework that encompasses all aspects of the livelihoods of tobacco growers and workers (including health, economic, social, environmental and food security aspects).

Principle 5. Policies promoting economically sustainable alternative livelihoods should be protected from commercial and other vested interests of the tobacco industry and leaf companies.

Principle 6. Partnership and collaboration should be pursued in the implementation of these policy options and recommendations, including technical and financial assistance.

4. IDENTIFYING AND DEVELOPING EFFECTIVE STRATEGIES FOR ALTERNATIVE CROPS AND LIVELIHOODS

4.1 Promoting research

4.2 Developing educational programmes for workers and growers

4.3 Removing barriers to diversification or switching to alternatives to tobacco farming or the manufacture of tobacco products

4.4 Curtailing policies that promote and support tobacco farming

4.5 Identifying and regulating tobacco industry strategies that promote tobacco farming and the manufacture of tobacco products

4.6 Mainstreaming alternative crops/livelihood options into government schemes, including national health programmes

4.7 Establishing mechanisms within the existing system to support alternative livelihoods

4.8 Setting up information and support centres for alternative crops/livelihoods

4.9 Ensuring the participation of civil society, including nongovernmental organizations
5. MONITORING AND EVALUATION

5.1 Alternative livelihoods model
5.2 Market information
5.3 Region-specific conditions
5.4 Environmental audit
5.5 Health impact
5.6 Key indicators

6. INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION

6.1 Parties to the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control have already undertaken a number of important commitments with respect to international cooperation, including those found in Articles 13.6, 20, 21, 22 and 26.

6.2 In the context of these policy options and recommendations, international cooperation should include the following aspects:

Promotion of opportunities for economically sustainable livelihoods and development of markets

6.3 Parties should promote economically sustainable alternative livelihoods at national and international level, particularly in regions in which tobacco is grown. Parties should take into account existing practices, local resources and climatic conditions when formulating policies and plans for economically sustainable alternative livelihoods.

6.4 Parties should make efforts to establish relationships with actors in domestic, regional and global markets, with a view to understanding the relevant supply and demand considerations, including the market requirements for alternative crops. Any alternative crop should be in harmony with sustainable management of natural resources.

Developing opportunities to counter seasonal trade in alternative crops

6.5 Parties should share research and expertise in new technologies to promote economically sustainable alternative crops with the objective of countering seasonal trade. This would help to improve the access of alternative crops to export markets.

Reducing tobacco production and/or promotion

6.6 Parties should, in cooperation with relevant national, regional and international organizations, not invest in the production and/or promotion of tobacco production. Parties should also gradually reduce the area under tobacco and take steps to redefine the role of the institutions or boards formed
for the promotion of tobacco and tobacco products. The effectiveness of efforts to gradually reduce the supply of tobacco and tobacco products, thereby reducing environmental degradation, depend not only on the initiatives undertaken by individual Parties but also on coordination and collaboration among Parties at the international level, so that efforts made to reduce tobacco production by one Party are not neutralized by another increasing production.

**Assistance and cooperation in capacity building for economically sustainable alternative livelihoods.**

6.7 Parties should cooperate, with each other and/or through competent international organizations in providing training, technical and financial assistance, and should cooperate in scientific, technical and technological matters, including transfer of expertise or appropriate technology in the areas of economically alternative livelihoods such as crop production and market intelligence.

6.8 Parties should enter into bilateral, multilateral or any other agreements or arrangements in order to promote training, technical assistance and cooperation in scientific, technical and technological matters, taking into account the needs of developing country Parties and Parties with economies in transition.

**International information exchange system**

6.9 Parties should, in cooperation with relevant international organizations and secretariats, establish and implement an international information exchange system on sustainable alternative livelihoods and global tobacco leaf demand, which would draw on official information made available by Parties and international organizations. This should lead to the creation of a database or similar resource on available best practices in different countries, so that these experiences could be used by other countries.

**International cooperation and the role of the Convention Secretariat**

6.10 The Convention Secretariat should facilitate collaboration between Parties and intergovernmental and nongovernmental organizations, to support the effective implementation of Articles 17 and 18.