

Post of Director-General

Options for the conduct of the election on the basis of paper-based voting

1. This report provides information on the use of a paper-based voting system for the conduct of the election of the Director-General and presents options for the conduct of paper-based voting in both the Executive Board and the Health Assembly in order to improve the efficiency and speed of the process. Further information is also provided on the modalities of the conduct of the voting and of the interviews of shortlisted candidates in the Board.

I. USE OF A PAPER-BASED VOTING SYSTEM IN THE EXECUTIVE BOARD AND THE HEALTH ASSEMBLY

2. The Health Assembly, in resolution WHA67.2 (2014), on Improved decision-making by the governing bodies, approved the recommendation of the Executive Board to rent a cost-effective and secure electronic voting system for the nomination and appointment of the Director-General, and to test such a system in advance through mock votes by the governing bodies before the election of the next Director-General.

3. The Secretariat investigated the availability of electronic voting systems and rented two systems. These were tested through a simulation exercise during both the 138th session of the Executive Board and the Sixty-ninth World Health Assembly, respectively. The first system, tested during the 138th session of the Executive Board, was rejected because it was difficult to use and testing revealed an unacceptable risk of null and void votes. The second system was tested at the Sixty-ninth World Health Assembly. It met the requirements for ease of use but the Secretariat indicated at that time that a security review would need to be carried out before a final decision to use the system could be taken.

4. An external security review of the second system conducted immediately following the Sixty-ninth World Health Assembly found that the system was insufficiently secure. It was also found that a suitable alternative electronic voting system could not be deployed in time for the election of the Director-General in 2017. As a consequence, the review concluded that the use of paper voting was the only feasible way forward for the upcoming election. It should further be noted that the review also recommended that the Rules of Procedure be reviewed and amended as necessary in order to adapt them more specifically to the use of an electronic voting system for the election of the Director-General in the future.

5. One of the prime rationales for the Health Assembly's approval in resolution WHA67.2 of the idea of exploring the use of electronic voting was to save time in the conduct of voting. Accordingly, the Secretariat has drawn up an operational plan for implementing paper-based voting, with a view to

proposing measures that reduce the time required for the conduct of each round of voting in a paper-based process.

6. This report makes proposals for time-saving measures in the conduct of voting at both the Board and the Health Assembly. The proposals concern the three most time-intensive stages of paper-based voting in WHO's governing bodies (distribution of ballot papers, collection of ballot papers, and counting of the votes).

7. The Board may accordingly wish to decide that paper-based voting will be used for the nomination of the Director-General. The Board may further wish to recommend to the Seventieth World Health Assembly the use of paper-based voting for the appointment of the Director-General.

II. OPTIONS FOR IMPROVING THE EFFICIENCY OF PAPER-BASED VOTING IN THE BOARD

8. Based on past experiences, the Secretariat estimates one round of voting in the Board to require a relatively short period of time, namely between 30 and 60 minutes. It is therefore proposed to conduct the distribution, collection and counting of ballot papers in the Board largely as in the past.

9. In order to save time, members of Board will find "voting shields" intended to guarantee the secrecy of the vote already set up on their tables at the outset of meetings at which voting is scheduled to take place.

10. The Secretariat proposes to use two ballot boxes instead of one to collect ballot papers from members of the Board at the close of voting.

11. Implementation of these proposals would not require any amendment to the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board.

III. OPTIONS FOR IMPROVING THE EFFICIENCY OF PAPER-BASED VOTING IN THE HEALTH ASSEMBLY

12. Based on past experiences, the Secretariat estimates that one round of voting at the Health Assembly requires up to one full morning or afternoon meeting of the Health Assembly if the traditional process prescribed by the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly and Health Assembly's Guiding Principles for the Conduct of Elections by Secret Ballot is followed in May 2017.

13. The Secretariat therefore proposes the time-saving measures described in the Table. Based on tests that have been conducted by the Secretariat, implementation of these measures could reduce the time required to conduct one round of voting at the Health Assembly to about 80 minutes per round.

14. Implementation of the measures in the Table will require minor adjustments by the Health Assembly to the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly and the Guiding Principles for the Conduct of Elections by Secret Ballot. These adjustments may be given effect by a partial suspension or amendment of applicable rules as set out in the right-hand column of the Table. If the Board wishes to recommend that the measures be implemented only for the appointment at the Seventieth World Health Assembly, a partial suspension of the relevant rules should be proposed in accordance with Rule 120 of the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly; otherwise the amendments set out

in the Annex should be proposed in accordance with Rule 119 of the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly.

Table. Proposals for time-saving measures for paper-based voting in the Health Assembly and consequent requirements for amendment or suspension of the Guiding Principles or Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly

Proposal		Is amendment or suspension of a Guiding Principle or Rule of Procedure of the World Health Assembly required?
(1)	<p>Delegations are called to vote simultaneously at six voting stations set up in front of each of the six seating blocks in the Assembly Hall at the Palais des Nations.</p> <p>Delegations are called to vote in the order they are seated in the six seating blocks.</p>	<p>Yes.</p> <p>The Guiding Principles for the Conduct of Elections by Secret Ballot require that members shall be called in turn to vote in the required alphabetical order of their names, beginning with the name of a Member which shall have been drawn by lot and that the call shall be made in English, French, Russian and Spanish.</p>
(2)	<p>One teller and one legal officer are positioned at each of the six voting stations. The legal officer distributes one ballot paper to each representative having come to the voting station at which he/she is positioned and records the distribution of a ballot paper to the respective delegation on a sheet of paper.</p>	<p>Yes.</p> <p>Rule 78 of the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly provides that, where a ballot is required, <u>two</u> tellers appointed by the President from among the delegations present shall assist in the counting of votes.</p> <p>The Guiding Principles for the Conduct of Elections by Secret Ballot refer to the ballot box in the <u>singular</u> throughout.</p>
(3)	<p>After each Member entitled to vote has inserted its ballot paper in the ballot box, the six tellers positioned at the voting stations carry the ballot boxes to the rostrum and place them on three tables.</p> <p>At each table, two tellers will then open the two ballot boxes placed on each table, count the votes and record the result on a sheet prepared for this purpose by the Secretariat.</p>	<p>Yes.</p> <p>As for (2) above.</p>
(4)	<p>One teller at each table carry the result sheet to a fourth table where the result of the vote will be recorded onto the appropriate WHO form.</p>	<p>Yes.</p> <p>As for (2) above.</p>

IV. MODALITIES OF THE CONDUCT OF THE VOTING IN THE EXECUTIVE BOARD

15. Meetings of the Board related to the nomination of the Director-General are convened as “open meetings” in accordance with Rule 7(b) of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board. Accordingly, attendance will be open to: members of the Board, their alternates and advisers; one representative of each Member State not represented on the Board and of each Associate Member; and the Secretariat. Representatives of Member States not represented on the Board and of Associate Members attend without the right to participate. No official record is made.

16. The modalities of the conduct of the voting during the short-listing and nomination phases are set out below. For further information on the majorities required at each stage and other legal issues please refer to document EB140/INF./1.

17. It is expected that candidates will be shortlisted on Tuesday, 24 January 2017 and the nomination will take place on Wednesday, 25 January 2017 after completion of the interviews. In line with previous practice, the Board may wish to decide in principle to meet in continuous session, without breaking between rounds of voting in the event that there is more than one round.

18. Members of the Executive Board will find voting shields already set up on their tables at the outset of meetings at which voting is scheduled to take place.

19. After the opening of a meeting at which voting is scheduled, the Chairman will appoint two tellers from among the members of the Board present to assist with the procedure. The Chairman will proceed to explain, with the assistance of the Legal Counsel, the details of the procedure to establish the shortlist and nominate candidates based on applicable rules, resolutions and decisions as well as established practice.

20. Before formally commencing the vote, the Chairman will invite the Legal Counsel to verify that the voting boxes are empty and will ask the Secretariat to distribute one ballot paper to each member of the Board present. Upon signal of the Chairman, the voting will be opened.

21. In line with previous practice, the names of the candidates will be written in English alphabetical order on the ballot papers. Thus, it will only be necessary to place a mark, such as an “X” or “check” (“√”), in the boxes next to the names of the candidates for whom each member of the Board wishes to vote. Members wishing to abstain may leave the ballot paper blank or indicate the word “abstention”. Any ballot paper on which more names than the number of places to be filled, namely five (in the first round of the short-listing phase) or three (in the nomination phase), are marked will be null and void. Any ballot paper on which fewer names than the number of places to be filled, namely five (in the first round of the short-listing phase) or three (in the nomination phase), are marked will likewise be null and void. Any ballot paper bearing a distinguishing mark, such as, for example, the name of the voter, will also be declared null and void. Should any member of the Board make a mistake, he or she should erase or cross out the mark made by mistake so that it is clear to the tellers that the ballot paper has been corrected and that it is equally clear which are the chosen candidates. If, during the voting, a new ballot paper is required, the delegation concerned is invited to raise its flag and request a new ballot paper, which will be printed by the Secretariat.

22. Members of the Board will have two minutes to complete their vote. The Chairman will make an announcement after one minute has expired. Any member expecting to require more time to finalize their vote at this stage should signal this to the Chairman when he makes his announcement.

The Chairman will then leave the vote open as needed until all members present have had the possibility to vote.

23. Once the time announced has expired, the Chairman will give signal for voting to close. Ballot papers should be folded once when they are deposited in the box. The Secretariat will pass by each of the members with the ballot boxes so that they may deposit their ballot papers.

24. The tellers will be invited to come to the centre table to count the votes. After completion of the count, the Legal Counsel will deliver the voting record sheet to the Chairman. The Chairman will report the results of the secret ballot to the Board by reading the number of votes obtained by each candidate. The Chairman will announce which candidates received the majorities required by the applicable rules.

25. For each successive round of voting, new ballots will be printed upon the Chairman's instructions.

26. The Chairman will read out the names of the shortlisted and nominated candidates respectively, in English alphabetical order, before adjourning the open meeting and reconvening in a public meeting to announce the names.

V. MODALITIES OF THE CONDUCT OF THE INTERVIEWS OF SHORTLISTED CANDIDATES

27. As indicated in document EB140/INF./1, the shortlisted candidates will be interviewed by the Board "as soon as possible" after the short list is drawn up.¹ The day for the interviews will be fixed in consultation with the Chairman. It is expected that candidates will be interviewed on Wednesday, 25 January 2017. Each interview will last not more than 60 minutes and will be divided equally between (a) an oral presentation of the candidate's vision for the future priorities of the Organization, with an analysis of current problems facing it and suggestions as to how those should be addressed, and (b) a question and answer session.²

28. The detailed modalities of the interviews are decided by the Board during the open meeting, on the proposal of the Chairman. The following modalities have been followed on the last four occasions on which nominations have been undertaken by the Board, and it is expected that the Chairman will invite the Board to proceed on the same basis on this occasion.

(a) The order in which candidates are interviewed is drawn by lot during the open meeting at which the short list is determined, so that the candidates can be informed in advance.

(b) The Secretariat times the presentation by each candidate using a traffic light system. The light remains green for 25 minutes, turns to amber and then turns to red after the allotted 30 minutes have expired, at which point the Chairman requests the candidate to terminate his or her presentation.

¹ Rule 52, seventh paragraph, of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board.

² Rule 52, eighth paragraph, of the Rules of Procedure of the Executive Board and decision EB100(7) (1997), paragraph 5.

- (c) Candidates may not use electronic presentation tools, such as PowerPoint, for their presentations.
- (d) Before the beginning of the presentation by each candidate, the Secretariat distributes to each Board member a paper on which the member may write one question for the candidate in any official language of the Board. The paper should also identify the member posing the question.
- (e) At the end of the presentation, the Secretariat collects the papers into a box and hands them to the Chairman. The Chairman draws a question at random and reads it to the candidate, disclosing which member is asking the question; the Chairman will be assisted by the Secretariat's interpreters, as necessary, in carrying out this task. The 30 minutes allotted for this part of the interview start running when the Chairman reads the first question.
- (f) Candidates have up to three minutes to respond to each question.
- (g) This part of the interview is also timed by traffic lights. One set of traffic lights times the 30 minutes; the light turns from green to amber after 25 minutes and to red upon expiry of the 30 minutes. The second set of traffic lights measures the time allotted for each question; the light turns on when the candidate begins his or her response, remains green for the entire three minutes, and turns red when the three minutes are up, at which point the Chairman will request the candidate to terminate his or her response to each question.
- (h) The Chairman will ask as many questions as possible within the time allotted for the question-and-answer period. If there are not enough questions to fill the whole duration of the 30 minutes allotted, the candidate will have the possibility of delivering an additional presentation until the 30 minutes have been exhausted.

ACTION BY THE EXECUTIVE BOARD

29. The Board is invited to note this report and consider adopting the following two draft decisions:

Draft decision 1

The Executive Board, having considered the report on Post of Director-General: options for the conduct of the election on the basis of paper-based voting contained in document EB140/4, decided to use a paper-based voting system for the nomination of the Director-General.

Draft decision 2

The Executive Board, having considered the report on Post of Director-General: options for the conduct of the election on the basis of paper-based voting contained in document EB140/4, decided:

(OP1) to recommend that the Seventieth World Health Assembly decide to use a paper-based voting system for the appointment of the Director-General;

(OP2) to recommend that the Seventieth World Health Assembly implement the proposals outlined in the Table in the report contained in document EB140/4, and

either

(a) adopt those proposed amendments in accordance with Rule 119 of the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly;

or

(b) suspend, to the extent necessary to implement the time-saving proposals outlined in that Table, those parts of the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly and the Guiding Principles for the Conduct of Elections by Secret Ballot identified in the Annex to document EB140/4, in accordance with Rule 120 of the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly.

ANNEX

**PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE RULES OF PROCEDURE OF THE WORLD
HEALTH ASSEMBLY AND THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR THE
CONDUCT OF ELECTIONS BY SECRET BALLOT**

Current version of Rule 78 of the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly	Proposed amended version of Rule 78 of the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly
(...) Where a ballot is required, two tellers appointed by the President from among the delegations present shall assist in the counting of votes.	(...) Where a ballot is required, two <i>or more</i> tellers appointed by the President from among the delegations present shall assist in the counting of votes.

Current version of the Guiding Principles for the Conduct of Elections by Secret Ballot	Proposed amended version of the Guiding Principles for the Conduct of Elections by Secret Ballot
Principle no. 1. Before voting begins, the President shall hand to the two tellers appointed by him the list of Members entitled to vote and the list of candidates. (...)	Before voting begins, the President shall hand to the two tellers appointed by him the list of Members entitled to vote and the list of candidates. (...)
Principle no. 3. The tellers shall satisfy themselves that the ballot box is empty and, having locked it, shall hand the key to the President.	The tellers shall satisfy themselves that the ballot box or ballot boxes is/are empty and, having locked it/ them , shall hand the key/ keys to the President.
Principle no. 4. Members shall be called in turn to vote in the required alphabetical order of their names, ¹ beginning with the name of a Member which shall have been drawn by lot. The call shall be made in English, French, Russian and Spanish.	Except as otherwise determined by the Health Assembly , Members shall be called in turn to vote in the required alphabetical order of their names, ¹ beginning with the name of a Member which shall have been drawn by lot. The call shall be made in English, French, Russian and Spanish.
Principle no. 7. When the ballot box has been opened, the tellers shall count the number of ballot papers. If the number is not equal to that of the voters, the President shall declare the vote invalid and another ballot shall be held.	When the ballot box or ballot boxes has/ have been opened, the tellers shall count the number of ballot papers. If the number is not equal to that of the voters, the President shall declare the vote invalid and another ballot shall be held.

= = =

¹ Under Rule 72 of the Rules of Procedure of the World Health Assembly.